

Mid term review report.

Public administration reform project in Ninh Binh

NORAD COLLECTED REVIEWS 5/2009

Vũ Cương, teamleader, and Bùi Quang Tuyền

Norad collected reviews

The report is presented in a series, compiled by Norad to disseminate and share analyses of development cooperation. The views and interpretations are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of the Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation.

Norad

Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation

P.O. Box 8034 Dep, NO- 0030 OSLO

Ruseløkkveien 26, Oslo, Norway

Phone: +47 22 24 20 30 Fax: +47 22 24 20 31

ISBN 978-82-7548-429-9

MID TERM REVIEW REPORT

**PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION
REFORM PROJECT
IN NINH BINH**

Evaluation Team:
Vũ Cường, Team leader
Bùi Quang Tuyên, Team member

Hanoi, December 2008

Table of content

Table of content	2
Acknowledgement	3
Abbreviations	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Background information of project.....	5
1. Introduction.....	6
1.1 Background information on the Project.....	6
1.2 Background of Mid term review.....	7
2. Review methodology and focus.....	9
2.1 Review methodology	9
2.2 Review focus.....	9
2.3 Interviewees and focus discussion group.....	10
2.4 Reviewing duration.....	11
3. Main findings.....	12
3.1. Relevance of the Project	12
3.2 Effectiveness of the Project	14
3.3 Project impact and sustainability	22
3.3.1 Project impact	22
3.3.2 Project sustainability.....	23
3.4 Project management and progress	24
3.5 Comparison between NB PAR Project and other relevant projects in Vietnam....	27
3.6 Sources of success.....	29
3.7. Obstacles and risks faced	30
4. Recommendations.....	31
4.1 Strengthening Project relevance and effectiveness.....	31
4.2 Enhancing Project sustainability.....	31
4.3 Improving project management quality	32
5. Appendices.....	39
Appendix 1. TORs for consultants.....	39
Appendix 2A. Guideline for focus group discussion and individual interview.....	39
Appendix 2B: Emailed interview questions to CTAs.....	44
Appendix 3. List of participants on individual interview and focus group discussion.	45

Acknowledgement

The Ninh Binh Public Administration Reform Project (NB PAR Project) Mid-term Review Team (MRT) would like to thank Project Management Unit (PMU) to provide us a great chance to work with the project.

MRT also would like to deeply thank enthusiastic supports of staff members of NB PAR Project, especially the sincere thanks is given to Mr. Alf Persson, Vice Chief Technical Advisor of the Project, Mr. Pham Van Bang, Project Director, Mr. Dinh Ngoc Van, Deputy Officer in Chief. Without those supports, MRT could not complete this report on time.

MRT also would like to thank all agencies which we visited and worked, and people of Gia Hoa and Thach Binh communes who shared opinions and comments on project operation and provide useful information to help us analysing and completing the report.

Lastly, we would like to express our grateful acknowledgement to our colleagues who provided us comments related to contents and format of this report so the report can be presented in a concise and useful manner.

Abbreviations

CPRGS	Comprehensive Poverty Reduction and Growth Strategy
CTA	Chief Technical Advisor
DOF	Department of Finance
DOHA	Department of Home Affairs
DOJ	Department of Justice
DOLISA	Department of Labor, Invalids and Social Affairs
DPI	Department of Planning and Investment
GoV	Government of Vietnam
HBPRP	Hoa Binh Planning Reform Project
MRT	Mid term Review Team
MUIZ	Management Unit of Industry Zones
NB PAR Project	Ninh Binh Public Administration Reform Project
OSS	One Stop Shop
PAR	Public Administration Reform
PDT	Provincial Department of Taxation
PIPA	Provincial Institution of Public Administration
PMU	Project Management Unit
PPC	Provincial People's Committee
PWU	Provincial Women's Union
SED	Socio-economic development
SEDP	Socio-economic development planning
SPAR-CB	Supporting Public Administration Reform Project in Cao Bang
TOR	Terms of Reference
VFF	Vietnam's Farther Front

Background information of project

Project title	:	Ninh Binh Public Administration Reform Project – Phase II (2006 – 2010)
Owner of Project	:	Ninh Binh People’s Committee
Donor	:	Norway
Project Steering Committee	:	Ninh Binh People’s Committee – Norway Embassy in Hanoi - The Ministry of Home Affairs
Project goal	:	To support Ninh Binh province to implement its public administration reform under the framework of the National PAR Master Program 2001-2010 and the socio-economic development plan of Ninh Binh province up to 2010.
Project starting date	:	September 2006
Project inception phase	:	30 th May, 2007
Project termination date	:	December 2010

1. Introduction

1.1 Background information on the Project

Ninh Binh Public Administration Reform Project – Phase II (2006 – 2010) (NB PAR Project) is implemented by Ninh Binh Provincial People’s Committee (PPC) and supported by Norway Government is the continuation of Phase I (1998-2003). Project inception phase lasted from September 2006 to May 2007. The second phase started from June 2007 and planned to terminate on December 2010.

NB PAR Project supports Ninh Binh province to implement Public Administration Reform (PAR) Program within framework of Vietnam Government (GoV) Administrative Reform Program (2001-2010), Socio-economic Development Plan (SEDP), and Poverty Reduction Program based on Comprehensive Poverty Reduction and Growth Strategy (CPRGS). Project has covered a broad range of issues including For Advancement of woman, gender equity and promotion of grassroots democracy. Especially, project has focused on PAR solutions in order to support poverty reduction effort and to bring benefits to the poor and low income groups.

Development objective:

To support Ninh Binh province to conduct administrative reform within Vietnam Government Administrative Reform Program in period 2001 – 2010 and Economic/Social development plan until 2010.

Project purpose:

To strengthen the effectiveness and efficiency of 3 levels of the local government in Ninh Binh province to serve the people and to alleviate poverty.

Project objectives

1. To pilot administrative reform solutions for improving services that support poverty alleviation
2. To support synchronous institutional and organizational reforms to enhance the operational effectiveness and efficiency of all 3 levels of local government
3. To strengthen the organizational capacity and human resources of grassroots authorities
4. To enhance the capacity and participation of women at all 3 levels of local government
5. To strengthen the capacity of the Vietnam Fatherland Front and its members in monitoring and inspection within the framework of the grassroots democracy decree

PMU) is functional agency of PPC, who is assigned for management, support and coordination of all Project activities.

There are sixteen (16) agencies in province involving in project, among which three (3) agencies have their own sub-projects including:

1. Provincial Women's Union (PWU)/Sub-project;
2. Department of Home Affairs (DOHA)/Sub-project;
3. Tam Diep Tow People's Committee/Sub-project;

and thirteen (13) implementing agencies:

4. Vietnam Fatherland Front (VFF);
5. Provincial Institution of Public Administration (PIPA);
6. Department of Planning and Investment (DPI);
7. Department of Finance (DOF);
8. Department of Justice (DOJ);
9. Department of Labor, Invalids and Social Affairs (DOLISA);
10. Management Unit of Industry Zones (MUIZ);
11. Administrative Reform Steering Committee
12. Ninh Binh People's Committee (PPC);
13. Nho Quan People's Committee;
14. Gia Vien District People's Committee;
15. Gia Hoa Commune People's Committee (Gia Vien District)
16. Thach Binh Commune People's Committee (Nho Quan District)

At grassroots level, a part from five (05) pilot communes (Cuc Phuong and Thach Binh of Nho Quan District; Nam Son and Dong Son of Tam Diep Town, and Gia Hoa Commune of Gia Vien District), there are some communes participating in other project pilot activities including Ninh Khang (Hoa Lu District), Kim Tan (Kim Son District), and Gia Phu, Gia Hung and Me sub-town (Gia Vien District).

1.2 Background of Mid term review

Agreement of Project Phase II was signed on June 2006. The project inception phase was finished on May 2007. The inception phase was started just after signing agreement but in fact that it was officially started from 18th September 2009 when Chief Technical Advisor (CTA) and Deputy CTA beginning their tasks.

Project inception phase was scheduled to finish on March 2007, but in reality it was finished on May 2007. Project implementation period was started from June 2007.

By the end of 2008, the project has been implemented in eighteen (18) months. The First Project annual meeting was organized on 17th January 2008. Project was also audited for period from June 2006 to December 2007. This work was done by an auditing company named KMPN.

In this period, project focused on such activities as (i) needs assessment review, base-line studies, capacity building for PMU and related agencies. Along with that, some pilot

models were soon experimented including One stop shop (OSS) model of Ninh Binh City, inter-agency OSS model on business licensing in DPI... Those models have been improved and gained significant success. To date, all project participating agencies has completed requirement of situational analysis, need identification and starting of their capacity strengthening and development of best practice models. In overall, project activities were intensively conducted since July 2008.

The mid-term review in the end of 2008 is very necessary to provide a comprehensive and objective assessment on project's achievements as well as project impacts, outcomes, and progress and recommendation for needed adjustments in coming years to ensure its meeting with project objectives.

2. Review methodology and focus

2.1 Review methodology

Qualitative assessment has been applied for this review. Individual and group interview were conducted with Leaders of Provincial, District, and Commune People's Committees; PMU staff members, project consultants, Deputy CTA (collecting information from the Deputy CTA was done through e-mail); staff members of sub-projects, staff in OSS models and representative of business community. Focus group discussions were conducted with beneficiaries of Gia Hoa and Thach Binh communes (each group consisted of 10 persons including both males and females).

Information is collected by the following methods:

- Desk review of secondary documents:
 - Project agreement and document;
 - Organization and coordination regulation;
 - Project implementation manual;
 - Monitoring and evaluation (M&E) framework of the Project and sub-projects;
 - Completion Report on inception phase;
 - Project evaluation report in the annual meeting;
 - Memorandum of Understandings between Ninh Binh Province and Norway Embassy.
- Individual interview and focus-group interview using semi – structured questionnaires. See Appendix 2 for details.

2.2 Review focus

According to the term of reference (See Appendix 1 in Vietnamese for more detail), the review would mainly focus on project *effectiveness*, or in what extent Project objectives has been achieved or going to be achieved. If possible, this review includes judgment of project *impact*. Focus point in the terms of reference (TOR) is “project having to adjust toward paying attention more to what beneficiaries receiving instead of vision of management persons on out puts and expected results”. This is project *relevance*. At the same time, the TOR showed clearly, review team should review also “progress of time” of project.

Therefore, learning and studies of review team in order to find answer for main questions below:

For project relevance:

- If project benefits reach mainly related audience (including female, male, and other male, and other audience)?
- If expected benefit agencies have been involved on implementing process?

For project effectiveness:

- If reality results are suitable with implementing objectives which were created since previous?
- If created activities in project plan were conducted and getting results?
- Characters and Institutions arrangements were changed as expectation, such as contacting with on stop shop, will be conducted how – or if that ability is occurred?

For project impact and sustain:

- If can forecast impacts (long term) of project to the PA strategy of local authority through the “strengthening effect, effectiveness of 3 levels of local government in Ninh Binh Province”?
- (Although not presenting in the TOR), review team trying to find support evidences (or not) for sustainability of project.

For project management (especial is progress):

- If responsibility sharing between related agencies is suitable?
- If project management is flexible and promoting participation of related agencies as well as beneficiaries?
- How risk management and external effect factors be done?
- Is progress of project is appropriate as project plan?

In addition, report need having competition with other administrative reform projects in Vietnam to provide PMU correlate vision between administrative reform project of Ninh Binh province and similar project which was implemented and be implementing in other projects.

Base on findings in focus contents mentioned above, review team will raise their recommendations.

2.3 Interviewees and focus discussion group

Using qualitative reviewing method, MRT has conducted focus-groups or individual interviews as detail list below. Contents of focus-group or individual interview are showed in appendix 3. Objective group which review team identified include: group of management persons and staff related to project implementing who work in Provincial, District and commune levels, CTA and Chief CTA, and project beneficiaries. Participants involving in this mid-term review as follow:

Provincial level

- Leader of Ninh Binh PPC; staff of OSS model of Ninh Binh City.
- Staff members of the PMU.
- Staff members of two sub-projects under PWU and DOHA.
- Leaders and staff members of VFF Committee.
- Leaders of PIPA.
- Staff members of inter-agency OSS model in DPI.

- Leaders and staff members of DOJ.
- Leader and staff members of MUIZ.
- Representative of Business community.

District level:

- Leaders of District People's Committee.
- Staff of OSS of Gia Vien District.

Commune level

- In Gia Hoa commune (Gia Vien District): People's Committee Leader; Heads of Trung Chinh village and beneficiaries of Village Common House.
- In Thach Binh commune (Nho Quan District): People's Committee Leaders and beneficiary groups.

2.4 Reviewing duration

Total duration of this mid-term review is 32 days, between 12th November 2008 and 15th December 2008.

3. Main findings

The main findings presented below emphasize on the key aspects as identified in section 2.2.

3.1. Relevance of the Project

One thing that can be affirmed is high relevance of the Project to local PAR needs and its significant contributions to meet citizenry needs, the key beneficiary of local poverty reduction effort, and businesses through simplification of administrative procedures.

This judgment is reinforced through direct communication of the Team with different project beneficiaries and relevant agencies. The Project is a key factor facilitating effective application of OSS and inter-agency OSS model in routine operation of the public administration of the province.

As reported by leaders of DPI, from January to 25th November 2008, DPI's OSS received and handled 960 applications for business license. For November only, from 1st to 25th, this office handled 43 applications. The processing speed has been significantly higher than before application of the OSS model.

Report of the Workshop on coordination mechanism in the field of business licensing held in April 2008 states that "Citizenry and businesses welcomed and highly appreciated great efforts of relevant administrative agencies in processing all required procedures for establishment of new business. In fact, *the OSS model has received warm acknowledgement and support from stakeholders, since it can provide straightforward and immediate gainful effects. Further examination and multiplication of this model should be seen as a focus in the coming period.*

Box 1. A summary of different responses of stakeholders to the OSS model

Interviewed commune leaders judged that "*Procedures in OSS have been simplified and transparency, publicity has been strengthened to facilitate customers' (citizenry and businesses) access to public services*".

Leaders of DPI, PTD and Provincial Police confirmed: "*The Project has facilitated operation of the inter-agency OSS model*".

Different ordinary citizens reflected: "*We have benefited a lot from OSS... Now we have to enter a single door instead of coming to too many doors in different agencies. This OSS model is very good. No cumber at all. Previously, we had to go to the district offices, queuing in a crowded space and spending three days for a stamp. Photocopying in district offices was also not simple matter... OSS is extremely helpful for us*".

As a businessman, Mr. Pham Xuan Muoc, assessed that *“Business community as ourselves felt that we were concerned, procedures simplified and OSS officers’ attitude in instructing us to fill out the forms were very friendly”*. Mr. Muoc also pointed out that to get a business license, it took currently only 5 days instead of 45 to 60 days as before.

Mr. Alf Persson, Vice Chief Technical Assistant of the Project, also has similar observation: *“The various OSS models... are the most successful and duplicable... Their outcome and effect are more direct and easier to notice, and involve and interest citizens very concretely”*.

In terms of poverty reduction effort, the Project has remarkable contributions to local poverty reduction through its variety of activities and initiatives including provision of poverty reduction related information and knowledge to local citizens in project sites. As expressed by Gia Hoa commune’s leaders, village households are now equipped with multi-dimensional information and knowledge in poverty reduction. Currently, the intensive cropping technique has been changed. Previously, farmers used to have only two crops (spring and autumn) per year. Now they know how to combine fish raising in the spring crop. Poverty rate in the commune fell from 12% in 2003 to 5% in 2008. Members of mass organizations voluntarily set up revolving fund to help each other to improve livelihood. Different clubs such as Club for Wives and Mothers, Club for Husbands and Fathers are established in villages to help each other in income generation activities. Female headed households among unmarried or single mother ones are favored when their credit applications for poverty reduction are screened. *In short, while not directly providing capital for poverty reduction, the Project’s support has created a local community based momentum for poverty reduction. This is very effective approach, since in one hand, it can consolidate the social cohesion in villages, and on the other hand, it gradually turns poverty reduction activities to be self-reinforced community efforts. However, how to develop a tailor made operation agendas for such organizations and/or clubs and to avoid formality is key to sustain such efforts.*

In addition, the Project has focused on strengthening people’s community management capacity as one of its main objectives. As stated by the People’s Committee Chairman of Gia Hoa Commune, the Project has helped to improve villagers’ legal awareness and income generation knowledge. Commune citizens actively participated in training courses held by the Project and had strong confidence in the effectiveness of OSS model in their locality. *“Thank for the Project, operational quality of our mass organizations is strengthened, especially that of Women’s Union, Youth’s Union and Farmers’ Association... The Project helped to improve management capacity of village officers... The community learning center must be sustained since it is a place that we can learn from each other”*.

Box 2. Positive changes in economic and community management at Trung Chinh Village, Gia Hoa Commune

The fact that the Project supported to construct the Common House of Trung Chinh Village and equipped it with computers and internet connection has been highly appreciated by villagers. They expressed that this was the first time that they were able to access to computers and internet. Such facilities have helped villagers to improve their social knowledge and to access to valuable source of information on livelihood development and market operation. The Operational Principles of the Common House has been set, demonstrating transparency and publicity of communal activities. When the team came to visit this House, there was a legal training session for villagers, which was held by Department of Justice within the framework of the Project.

3.2 Effectiveness of the Project

To assess project effectiveness, the Project log frame is used as a foundation to judge in what extent and how project activities can contribute to expected outputs. For the question whether project objectives, is fully met, can be able to achieve project goal can not be judged in certain since the Project has still been in mid term.

According to the Project log frame, objectives from 1 to 5 should be met if specific outputs are fully made. The following evaluation is an effort of the team to quantify the extent of meeting objectives through assessing the extent that expected outputs are delivered.

The evaluation ladder: The ladder with four different levels is used to evaluate the extent of meeting the Project objectives.

- **Fully achieved – Grade 4:** An objective is evaluated as fully achieved if 95% or more of planned outputs under this objective are produced.
- **Substantially achieved – Grade 3:** An objective is evaluated as substantially achieved if 75% to less than 95% of planned output under this objective are produced.
- **Partly achieved – Grade 2:** An objective is evaluated as substantially achieved if 50% to less than 75% of planned output under this objective are produced.
- **Fails to achieve – Grade 1:** An objective is evaluated as substantially achieved if less than 50% of planned outputs under this objective are produced.

Hereby is detailed presentation of the team’s findings and analysis on the extent that project expected outputs are delivered and its objectives are met.

Objective 1: “To pilot administrative reform solutions for improving services that support poverty alleviation”

For the expected output 1: “International and Vietnamese PAR solutions for poverty alleviation identified, circulated, and discussed”, the Project organized various domestic study tours and learnt lessons have been applied in different models developed by Ninh Binh province. Specifically, poverty reduction experiences from Vietnam – Sweden Chia Se Program in Quang Tri province, the model of community development for poverty reduction in Ky Tho commune, Ky Anh district, Ha Tinh province and experiences of Khanh Hoa province have been integrated in the establishment of the Common House in Trung Chinh Village, Gia Hoa Commune, the model of community participation in poverty reduction in Thach Binh Commune, and the proposal to support community learning centers in 6 pilot communes. Such experiences aim to facilitate villagers’ participation and strengthen capacity of grassroots government by enhancing two-way communication between villagers and public administration. Community based poverty reduction experience, which were introduced in 6 pilot communes, is highly valued.

In addition, different studies on PAR were also held by the Project (e.g. those on OSS models, gender equality, promotion of grassroots democracy with the integration of poverty reduction purpose) in Hai Phong, Hanoi, Bac Ninh, Lao Cai, Vinh Phuc, Quang Ninh, Hai Duong and Lang Son. Lessons from those studies then have been applied in PAR and OSS models of Ninh Binh province, including inter-agency OSS in different provincial departments, and OSS models at district and commune levels.

Concerning different kinds of OSS models, positive reactions from leaders and front-line officers have been expressed regarding Ninh Binh City’s OSS, inter-agency OSS in DPI (between DPI, PTD and Provincial Police), Nho Quan District’s and Gia Hoa Commune’s OSS and that of the MUIZ. Together with improving quality of the existing OSS models, the inter-agency OSS model between MPI, PTD and Provincial Police in business licensing is a successful PAR initiative that is welcomed by enterprises. From that success, the province is going to develop another inter-level OSS model for selected public services in DOLISA. While MPI’s inter-agency OSS emphasized clearly on horizontal coordination among public agencies at provincial level, that of DOLISA will experiment the vertical coordination between provincial, district and commune levels in providing public services for citizens, especially the poor.

In Ninh Binh City’s OSS, which has been operated since August 2007, all regulations and procedures are posted in the waiting room. Clients can read such information easily. To check whether their applications are processed or not, clients are just required to scan their codes, then needed information is automatically provided.

The modern equipment and application of information technology in this OSS is supported by the Project and they have clearly helped to improve efficiency and effectiveness of the OSS. Notably, Ninh Binh City’s OSS model is a well-known PAR solution. As stated by Project Director, so far 36 delegations from different provinces had come to visit this OSS. Other delegations from Bhutan and Canada also planned to visit this model.

Box 3. Feedback on the helpfulness of the inter-agency OSS model in DPI

“Since the 1st November 2008, it takes only 5 days for new business establishment to get its business license, including time for registering stamp sample with Provincial Police. This is a big improvement in administrative procedure, given that before the operation of the inter-agency OSS in DPI, it took 21 days, and then reduced to 12 days for business licensing” .

“The Project has equipped OSS with computers, fax machine, air-conditioners and chairs in the waiting room. Such equipments have helped to facilitate operation of the inter-agency OSS”.

“Communication between OSS staff and clients has positively changed; their servicing skills and operational cooperation has been improved as well”.

“Clients get used with new procedures and regulations at the OSS. Introduction of services delivered in the inter-agency OSS is made through local broadcasting system, but a portion of citizenry does still not know about it”.

“Almost all activities in the inter-agency OSS are well performed. However, higher work pressure required greater effort from all staff members, while they are still expected to fulfil their routine administrative tasks and responsibilities and provision of information to clients. OSS staff members have also to arrange their time to work with PTD and Provincial Police”.

“Application of information technology has saved administrative costs due to reduction in printing cost”.

By the same token, OSS model at district level brings benefits to citizenry. Number of clients receiving services in OSS in Nho Quan district has substantially increased as reflected in Table 1. Figures in this table presents increasing workload of administrative services demanded by citizenry and businesses.

Table 1: Number of cases for administrative services being processed in Nho Quan district

Type of services	2008			
	July	August	September	October
Granting Certificate for Land use right	49	113	203	256
Granting business license	15	14	20	24
Verifying eligibility for social policies	88	146	166	89

Source: Nho Quan District’s Division of Home Affairs

However, staff member in Nho Quan District's OSS expressed that they were not fully confident about their understanding of procedures and policies set by the province and central government related to the cases that they had to handle. Therefore, they wished to be able to attend relevant workshops and training to update them with new policies.

For the expected output 2: "Integration of the principle of pro-poor governance and pro-poor growth into policy making and policy implementation. Effective and efficient coordination among sectors at all three levels involved in planning and delivering poverty alleviation-related services", baseline study report on current local officers' awareness of pro-poor governance and growth principles and on government capacity, gender equality and grassroots democracy in five pilot communes are accomplished. They are important basis for monitoring progress after getting affected by the Project.

By the time that this midterm review is conducted, the idea of pro-poor growth and governance and related PAR initiatives has been integrated in PAR planning, implementation and evaluation of public authorities at all levels (province, district and commune). Nevertheless, since this effort is still in the initial stage, it is premature to conclude its effectiveness.

For the expected output 3: "Integration of feedback from different strata of the poor into policy making, and communication of information on poverty alleviation-related services to the poor", feedback mechanisms have been developed by setting up Mail box for comment in every OSS, including the inter-agency OSS in DPI, Nho Quan District's OSS and that of MUIZ, and the hot-line in Ninh Binh City's OSS. Since the mail boxes seem not be an effective way to get clients' feedback, DPI is considering to post names of servicing officers in OSS so that clients can comment more conveniently.

For other poverty reduction initiatives, assistance of the Project for Community Learning Centers in 6 pilot communes and the establishment of Common House in Trung Chinh Village (Gia Hoa Commune) has strengthened two-way communication between citizenry and local government, so that government's consultation capacity and villagers' participation skills in Project activities are enhanced.

For the output 4: "Strengthened capacity of the commune-level administration to manage poverty alleviation services/activities", a baseline study on current poverty status and available anti-poverty services was conducted in 4 pilot communes locating in different geographical location. Similar study on poverty reduction management capacity of commune-level administration was also completed. Based on those studies, appropriate PAR initiatives to improve poverty reduction related services in 4 pilot communes were identified focusing on (a) strengthening needed capacity for commune-level administrative officers and (b) providing needed supports for relevant provincial and district-level agencies.

Other expected outputs under Objective 1 are not implemented yet since they are planned to be produced in later stage of the Project' life cycle.

It can predict that Objective 1 (the most important one) can be fully achieved at the end of the Project's life cycle.

Objective 2: To support synchronous institutional and organizational reforms to enhance the operational effectiveness and efficiency of all 3 levels of local government

For the expected output 1: “Short-term training courses on cross cutting issues designed and delivered”, a skill strengthening course was held for nearly 200 grassroots officers with the participation of part-time instructors who are technical staff members of provincial departments and agencies in November 2008. The course equipped current government officers with needed skills and provided Department of Home Affairs (DOHA) input information to recommend PPC needed revisions in its Training Plan for provincial government officers in period of 2008-2010. With the Project’s technical support, this plan was developed by DOHA in a more result-based fashion.

For the expected output 2: Capacity strengthened in the Provincial Institute of Public Administration (PIPA) and pilot District Political Schools ”, a training course on active training method was held for 16 PIPA’s resource instructors. New active training methods are highly appreciated by participants. As pointed by PIPA’s leaders, training courses held in the first phase of the Project had made positive impact in the sense that all training sessions under the Project’s support were delivered following active training method. Also as expressed by them, the extent of application of this method in other lectures still varied depending on nature of each lecture and readiness of participants. One disadvantage was that some of resource instructors were already getting retired or shifted to other positions. New instructors were recruited from different background and training institutions, so that their practical and teaching experiences were still ill. The absorption capacity of resource instructors in the first phase was limited. All those factors attributed to the fact that in overall, teaching in PIPA was still dominated mainly by traditional one-way lecturing approach and training curriculum did not tailor to the need yet. In addition, the group of resource instructors in District Political School in Tam Diep comprises part-time government officers – lecturers and its trainees were grassroots officers (at village/ward level). Therefore, they could not develop their training materials for themselves. Since training materials were developed by external consultants, they may not really fit to capacity of the current lecturers. *In summary, the expected output 2 is evaluated as being in process. Various training courses were held but have not provide expected effect. This output should be further strengthened in coming years, but the commitments of political schools should be enhanced, not only by verbal expression, but also by concrete actions including carefully selecting durable contingent of resource instructors, setting up a clear roadmap for application of new active training method in different subjects, and providing recommendations to Provincial Party Bureau to delegate more flexibility and autonomy to the schools in training curriculum development and integration of “demand-driven” topics into the existing curriculum.*

For the expected output 3 “Skill-based training courses for grassroots authorities developed and delivered”, a training course on strengthening technical skills for commune-level government officers including Chair of Commune People’s Council, Chair of Commune People’s Committee, accountant, justice officers and Chief Commune Officer, with the

participation of about 180 trainees. The training course equipped participants with new knowledge and skills to increase their confidence in performing the role of instructors for other self-organizing training courses at commune level as stated in the Training Plan for government officers by year 2010. Also after the course, the model of community participation in poverty reduction effort has been established in Thach Binh commune (Nho Quan District). *Therefore, training activities in this output has been held on schedule. The point here is the following up activity to measure applicability of such knowledge and skills in their own work. Based on that, shortcomings and inappropriateness can be identified to revise training curriculum or shift from formal training to direct coaching in the field in order to improve effectiveness of the support.*

For the expected output 4 “Capacity strengthened in urban and rural management at the grassroots-level government”, the Project so far has organized capacity building courses and developed participatory models in Thach Binh commune (Nho Quan District). By contrast, no significant activity is implemented in Nam Son ward.

In general, the Objective 2 is evaluated as partly achieved to date.

Objective 3: To strengthen the organizational capacity and human resources of grassroots authorities

So far, some key outputs of this objective has been achieved on schedule through a series of activities. As for the expected output 1 “Consistent and unified process and procedures for preparing and issuing legal and administrative documents for all local government levels”, Department of Justice in conjunction with the Project has completed the draft of Legal Document Issuance Procedure and Legal Document Dissemination Process for commune government with the assumption that following these procedure and process will help to strengthen capacity of commune officers in pilot sites and accessibility of villagers, especially females and the poor to information on government policies and relevant legal documents.

Expected output 3 “The enhancement in quality of services of one stop shop centres at all three levels (continued support of Phase I positive results)” has been assessed as fully achieved. At this moment, service quality in various OSS models has not only improved, but the inter-agency OSS has been successfully operated in DPI providing motivation for the province to expand it into other public services in DOLISA.

To produce expected output 4 “Quality of PAR plans improved and PAR monitoring and evaluation mechanisms strengthened”, two training courses on Result-based management were delivered by a combination of international and domestic consultants in January and May 2008. After these courses, public agencies started to develop their own result-based PAR plans for 2009. The group of consultants was also recruited to document training materials of such courses to be Guidance Manual for Result-based PAR Planning. The manual was commented by different stakeholders and revised in November 2008. Currently, the manual has been finalized and become an useful device to improve effectiveness and efficiency of planning practice in provincial departments and district People’s Committees. In the 10th December 2008, Decision 2230/QD-UBND was issued

by PPC to approve the result-based PAR plan for Ninh Binh province in 2009. This is a great attempt of the province to promote PAR program in the locality.

The expected output 5 “To complete local budget management decentralization, enhance quality of self-control right, self – responsible implementation on finance for administration agencies and public non-business units and enhance capacity of budget estimates planning and executing in Tam Diep Town and Gia Vien district” was also on schedule implemented through technical support of domestic consultants. Based on information provided by PMU, local agencies in charge of public finance reform (Ninh Binh Department of Finance (DOF), Divisions of Finance and Planning (DFP) in Tam Diep Town and Gia Vien District) were supported by a group of central and local consultants in developing training curriculum and materials, and instructing pilot agencies to conduct selected activities in alignment with the reform agenda set by the GoV. Those activities were mainly implemented in the second half of 2008. Sustainability of such activities was ensured as DOF leader committed to apply uniformly templates and guidelines for preparation of Internal Control Procedures which was developed by consultants province-wide for all public administrative agencies and public service delivery units. DOF also coordinated with central consultants to deliver training courses in such topics for public account owners and accountants in provincial-level departments and agencies. In Gia Vien District, technical staff and leaders of People’s Council and Committee in 21 communes and sub-towns were trained in commune budget management. In addition, three pilot agencies (Gia Hung commune, Gia Phu commune and Me sub-town) were coached how to make budget plan in 2009 in new approach. Similar activities were conducted in pilot agencies in Tam Diep Town to strengthen local capacity in capital budget management. Generally speaking, activities in public finance management reform were welcomed by different agencies since they linked directly to interests of pilot agencies. They were perceived by pilot agencies as compulsory tasks and responsibilities in accordance with requirements of State Budget Law and already approved roadmap of public finance management reform, but they had faced a lot of difficulties in compliance. Thank for consultants’ assistance, they can overcome those obstacles and better perform their tasks and responsibilities. Consequently, local public finance management authorities expressed their expectation that all pilot activities in this field which was implemented in 2008 would be replicate in a wider scale in 2009.

Unfortunately, the remaining expected outputs including output 2 “A rational framework for administrative procedures designed and applied at all three levels so that duplication is minimized and public administration services are provided to the people in the most efficient way”¹; output 6 “Complete the human resource management decentralization in of Ninh Binh province”; output 7 “Capacity building necessary for the implementation of the outputs and activities listed in Objective 3” and output 8 “Vietnamese and/or international experiences related to the implementation of Objective 3 identified, discussed, and circulated” have not significantly progressed.

The objective 3, therefore, is evaluated as substantially achieved to date.

¹ In some extent, the establishment of OSS models has substantially contributed to this output. However, other models than OSS have not been developed yet.

Objective 4: To enhance the capacity and participation of women at all 3 levels of local government

The key agency in charge of this objective is Provincial Women's Union (PWU). The review team has strong impression on PWU's proactiveness in conducting baseline survey on the extent of gender integration at grassroots level.

The expected output 2 "Capacity strengthened for the Committee for the Advancement of Women and the Women's Union at all levels" is substantially met. Members of PWU's sub-projects confirmed that their capacity was substantially improved after attending study and experience sharing tours in poverty reduction and gender equality, and participating training courses on gender integrated planning and monitoring.

There are some positive signals indicating partial achievement of the expected output 5 "Capacity strengthening in gender mainstreaming for female cadres, civil servants, and People's Council deputies at all levels". PWU pointed that they had actively advised government authorities in strengthening female capacity and their involvement in government system. The attitude towards assigning female cadres to hold leadership positions in public agencies has been positively changed. For example, two female officers are promoted to be Vice directors of the District Division of Education and Training in Yen Khanh District and another female officer is holding the position of Director of Provincial Department of Industry and Trade, the fact that has never happened before.

However, there is no evidence for the achievement of other expected output (1, 3, 4, 6). It is also not clear that aforementioned positive changes can be attributed to the proactiveness of PWU itself or support of the Project, since so far, the most significant assistance of the Project as organization of a training course on gender integration understanding and skills which was planned to be delivered by international consultant(s) in 2008 has not been realized. Delays in achieving this objective can be attributed to the fact that many activities under these expected outputs are not planned to be implemented before the review mission and difficulties in coordination among PMU, PWU and international consultant(s). As an example, PIPA affirmed that they could not integrate gender issues in their training plan and curriculum yet.

The objective 4, therefore, is evaluated as failed to achieve to date.

Objective 5: To strengthen the capacity of the Vietnam Fatherland Front and its members in monitoring and inspection within the framework of the grassroots democracy decree

As core tasks of VFF in Ninh Binh province in the period of 2006-2010 has been expansion and promotion of grassroots democracy through strengthening direct democracy, improving oversight quality and effectiveness of VFF, its member organizations and People's Inspectorate in promoting grassroots democracy, conducting poverty reduction efforts and enhancing social cohesion, VFF has been identified by the Project as a strategic partner. So far the oversight function of VFF and its member

organizations is poorly performed due to various reasons as inconsistent perception of VFF's roles, ill definition of its functions and overlapping with other agencies, poor understanding of oversight officers on overseeing methods and skills (presentation, report writing and information analysis skills among others), underprovision and ineffectiveness of training for oversight officers and ill coordination between VFF and relevant agencies. Therefore, the emphasis of the Project on this Objective is to help VFF to remove such obstacles.

To meet this objective, the Project has planned to implement a range of activities in order to produce expected output 1 “Capacity strengthening for cadres in the Vietnam Fatherland Front, its member organizations, and the People’s Inspectorate” and expected output 2 “Integration of the grassroots democracy principle into the implementation of Objectives 1 to 4”. Staff members of VFF confirmed that they were benefited from training course on project management, monitoring and evaluation and some relevant workshops. Such activities were conducted by VFF with technical and financial support from the Project. However, the in-depth training for VFF staff members which planned to be held in November 2008 had to be postponed to March 2009. In general, VFF's oversight function has not been consistently understood even within the VFF Committee. Some staff members explained that since the GoV did not have clear regulation for VFF to punish or sanction violating agencies if some violation was found in VFF's field visits, they felt very hard to be effective overseeing body. This showed that even staff members of VFF Committee were *not fully aware* of their function as making voices rather than handling violating cases in legal aspects.

The objective 5, therefore, is evaluated as failed to achieve to date.

3.3 Project impact and sustainability

3.3.1 Project impact

There is no clear evidence to date to evaluate project impact. However, given the extent of achievement of stated Project objectives and its high relevance to local needs (including that of government agencies, citizenry and business community), it can be predicted with high certainty that the Project will contribute significantly to Developmental goal and provide long-term impacts on local poverty reduction, especially in beneficiary agencies, communes and districts. This prediction is reinforced by a various feedbacks collected from citizenry and government staff members:

- Empowerment for local citizenry: *“Our villagers are consulted by commune and village officers on village’s priorities. We feel the strength of our community has been enhanced”*.

- Enhancement of citizenry participation in community management: *“Since the Project provides support, our village seems more active and lively. Meetings are frequently organized”*.
- Enhancement of gender equality: *“Female capacity is strengthened. Gender equality is improved. Our villagers’ production knowledge is advanced. Some now are able to use computers and search in Internet for information on cultivation and husbandary techniques.”*

3.3.2 Project sustainability

Some evidence can be found to demonstrate sustainability of groups of project activities. More specifically,

For activities to direct support communities, local citizenry has actively expanded project activities beyond the scope of project support. Citizens in Gia Hoa commune, for example, after participating in the Project has set themselves an annual target of constructing one village meeting house for every village, since currently there are only two meeting houses in the entire commune. Each meeting house will cost from VND 300 to 600 million (or equivalently, USD 17,570 to 37,500), of which the commune will contribute 40% of construction cost, the remainder is contributed from villagers. Key village officers are willing to contribute from 3 to 5 times higher than normal households. By the same token, villagers in Trung Chinh village are willing to pay for operational cost of the Village Commone House at a norm of VND 2,000 per person per year. Some households voluntarily contribute books and readings for the public bookshelf in the Common House. Old villagers can go to the House for borrowing books and participate in different self-organized clubs such as Poem Club or Aquaculture Club which are proved as an effective vehicle for community’s mutual support in poverty reduction. As responded by a villager in Trung Chinh village: *“Our villagers are willing to contribute for sustaining operation of the Village Commone House”*. Additionally, according to the agreement between the Project and the village, operation and maintenance cost of Community Training Centers will be supported by the Project budget up to 2010. After that, those centers will operate on the self-financing principle. This agreement implies that sustainability of the model of community training center will depend on the willingness to contribute and affordability of citizenry, as well as attractiveness and need-matching of meeting agenda of such centers, clubs and/or commune houses so that villagers see engagement in public activities in these as a gain for themselves.

For activities to strengthen decentralized financial management capacity, the Project has played only catalyst role to stimulate fiscal decentralization process. Given the GoV’s decentralization policy, fiscal decentralization has been a focal point of public finance management reform. Therefore, it is safe to affirm that activities initiated and/or supported by the Project in this field at provincial and district levels (e.g. Gia Vien District and Tam Diep Town) will be maintained even after support from the Project is terminated.

For activities to integrate gender issues in PAR actions in particular and societal governance in general, Women's Unions throughout the country has made best attempt to promote, especially after the promulgation of Gender Equality Law in 2007. It is therefore reasonable to predict that these activities will be continued even after termination of the Project, given proactiveness of PWU in Ninh Binh.

Some concerns may be raised regarding sustainability of OSS models. As observed by some citizens and government officers working in OSS, the review team recommends that the Project and Ninh Binh province should consider a comprehensive action package to enhance sustainability of these models including capacity building for OSS staff, upgrading of facilities and working conditions, provision of chance for promotion and incentives to work in OSS, and wider introduction of OSS services to citizenry... Further, a performance based remunerations system should be established so that OSS staff can be paid in accordance with objective and quantifiable evaluation of performance.

3.4 Project management and progress

Project management:

Result based management has been applied in the Project. Project participating agencies are also required to develop their proposal in a result based fashion. The Project document and proposals has developed their own logframes in which various monitoring indicators are set.

Managerial tools for project and financial management include Project organization and coordination procedures, Project Implementation Manual and its cost norm system. These are fundamental foundation for project and financial management.

The establishment of sub-project management units is seen as a mechanism to reinforce commitment, discretion and sustainability of implementing agencies and reduce workload for the PMU. Sub projects are responsible for expected outputs and management of day-by-day activities including financial management. The PMU only provides support in preparing Terms of Reference, recruiting consultants, setting indicators for expected outputs, allocating budget, monitoring overall progress and evaluating results. Apart from reporting to the PMU, sub-project management units have to report to heads of their agencies and/or People's Committee at the same level. The most significant strength of the existence of sub-project management units is that the "ownership" of implementing agencies including VFF Committee, PWU, MUIZ and PIPA are enhanced. This helps to strengthen relevance of the Project, since those agencies have closet relations with citizenry (PWU and VFF Committee) or business community (MUIZ). PIPA has played an intermediary role to intensify impact of the Project, since PIPA is the training institution that provides training for local management in all level, who in turn are core factor for important changes in PAR process. However, the establishment of sub-project management units may bear a risk that the PMU does not have full control over resources, especially human resources, sub-project implementing agencies. More details are analyzed in Section "Obstacles and risks".

Apart from setting up subproject management units, the PMU has also supervised and coordinated directly activities in other beneficiary units. On one hand, this management

modality can allow the PMU to monitor closely and intervene timely in project activities to ensure quality and promptness. On the other hand, it requires high accountability, dynamics and skillfulness of the PMU. In that sense, Ninh Binh PMU has well performed.

M&E system of the Project has developed to measure Project activities and evaluate quality and effectiveness of the Project.

Project progress:

As reviewing Project work plan and comparing planned and actually performed activities to date, it can be said that *most of activities are implemented timely and aligned with Project objectives and goal.*

However, the following activities fail to meet schedule. More specifically,

In the sub-project of PWU: The training on gender integration and enhancement of female status in contingent of key provincial leaders, which was planned for implementation in November 2008, but now has to shift to the first quarter of 2009, due to delay in selection of international and domestic consultants (the selection had to be posted in provincial broadcasting). When consultants were selected, their schedule did not fit to planned schedule for the training. Currently, selection of consultants has already completed and PWU has shown their readiness for the training in the first quarter of 2009.

A study tour in Thailand on gender integration in promotion of grassroots democracy, gender equality and poverty reduction for the delegation of about 12 members coming from VFF Committee, PWU, DOLISA and DOJ, the PMU, DPI and DOF... has to shift from November 2008 to the first quarter of 2009 as well, since the first study tour on PAR to Malaysia was just conducted from September 25 to October 2008 and all participating agencies were busy late in year 2008.

In the sub-project of VFF Committee: The training for strengthening oversight capacity and sample conducting of oversight activity in three pilot communes has not implemented yet because VFF Committee was busy for guiding communes to collect feedback on performance of commune officers from villagers and 6 members of the Committee has retired in 2008. In addition, there was severe flooding in Ninh Binh in 2008. Given the role of VFF Committee in disaster relief, it had to prioritize for this task and could not arrange the training, while training materials are not completely prepared yet. By all means, this training is rescheduled to March 2009 instead of November 2008 as originally planned.

In the sub-project of MUIZ: Development of operation procedure for OSS in MUIZ is completed. The sectoral coordination mechanism in processing administrative procedures relating to investors' applications in industrial zones is not completed as scheduled. Although it has the sixth draft, the agreement among relevant agencies has not been reached yet. Then, it is expected to be completed in June 2009. As reported by MUIZ, the

main reason for the delay was restructuring of provincial agencies, leading to unexpected change in their mandates and tasks. For example, the Committee of Religion and Ethnic Minorities has been merged into DOHA, Population Committee into Department of Health, Committee for Children Protection and Care into DOLISA, Department of Industry and Department of Trade has been merged together into Department of Industry and Trade), all of which are relevant to operation of MUIZ.

In the sub-project of PIPA: The training on active training for PIPA’s resource instructors, which was planned to be conducted in the third quarter of 2008, has not been organized yet, because both PIPA and the PMU are too busy to recruit appropriate consultants. This course has been rescheduled to the beginning of the second quarter of 2009. By the same token, due to incompleteness of three sets of training materials on poverty reduction, grassroots democracy and gender equality, the training course on those three topics must be postponed. While preparation of these sets of training materials should be accomplished in the last quarter of 2008, Mr. Nguyen Xuan Hanh - PIPA’s vice rector – explained that they could not meet the target because their teachers had to finish a huge workload beside preparation of training materials.

In the PMU: Equipment procurement for information centers in communes is behind schedule because bidding procedure took a long time to finish. As planned, this procurement should be completed in the third quarter of 2008. At the moment of this review, bidding was opened. The PMU’s leader predicted that by mid December 2008, all procured equipments would be sent to beneficiary communes.

Table 2: Summary of disbursement result, by objectives

Objective	Total budget (USD)	Actually performed by October 2008	% of total budget
Objective 1	71.870	10.841,5	15
Objective 2	198.570	14.799,8	7
Objective 3	290.140	162.933,9	56
Objective 4	103.280	7.743,6	7
Objective 5	69.480	3.372,6	5
Project management	630.860	341.138,5	54
Contingency	35.000	0	0
Duplication	200.000	0	0

Total	1.599.200	540.830	34
-------	-----------	---------	----

Estimated by December 2008, disbursement ratio can reach to 45% of total budget.

Source: PMU

From those results and why some delays in Project activities can occur, two main reasons can be found as lessons for the coming years:

- PMU's annual work plan was too ambitiously set and potential risks and obstacles were underestimated. Some delays evidently stemmed from coordination (unable to coordinate among work plans of consultants, PMU and implementing agencies). This is a repeated problem, especially for a project covering a large scope of activities and relating to many beneficiaries as Ninh Binh PAR Project. This weakness should be seriously taken into account when making work plans for coming years.
- Even implementing agencies including VFF Committee, MUIZ and PWU are occupied by many unexpected political responsibilities that force them to compromise implementation of Project activities. This also implies weakness in risk analysis and passive role of implementing agencies in dealing with unplanned events. Therefore, it is in urgent need that Project work plan must be rolled out into annual routine work plan of implementing agencies and risk analysis and management capacity of implementing agencies should be strengthened..

3.5 Comparison between PAR Project in Ninh Binh and other relevant projects in Vietnam

Currently, different provinces have received support from different donors for their institutional reform, including Nam Dinh Urban Development Project and Supporting PAR in Cao Bang province (SPAR-CB) funded by Switzerland's SDC, Hoa Binh's Planning Reform Project (HBPRP) funded by Japan's Jica, Strengthening capacity of socio-economic development (SED) planning, implementation and public service delivery project in Kon Tum province (Kon Tum – UN Project) co-funded by three UN organizations including UNDP, UNICEF and UNPA, Vietnam-Sweden Chia Se Poverty Reduction Program funded by Sweden's Sida in three provinces including Ha Giang, Yen Bai and Quang Tri... While all those project may pursue different goals and objectives, and not all of them focuses singly on PAR, they always have a component related to PAR in general and institutional reform in particular. Given time constraint that the team could not evaluate and/or compare results of Ninh Binh PAR Project with all other projects in a systematic and scientific way, the following lessons should be treated as personal observations and value judgment based on experiences gained by the consultants' direct involvement in those projects in different extent.

The common feature of all aforementioned projects is close link between PAR, poverty reduction and local economic development. This is an optimal combination, since it can

show direct benefits of PAR in local livelihood improvement, so that effectiveness of PAR can be easily recognized and supported.

Secondly, each project may choose different reforms as entrance point for local PAR and in alignment with the GoV's reform scheme. Such selection bases on the assumption that by improving the ignition point, projects can create a need for reform in other points and gradually those spill over effects can make a change in thinking and working style in public sector. This is a right approach, since given time and resource constraint, a project cannot touch upon all aspects of public administration without making a chaos in this sector while public officers are not ready for a change.

Thirdly, the “entrance points” of PAR are selected based on local needs. Donors usually do not impose their own choice. Rather, carefully studies were conducted to identify local needs before developing log frame of their projects. Advantage of this approach is that it enable sustaining momentum for change and ensuring local accountability for expected results. However, it also require some flexibility in the approach, since when raising needs local authorities may not be fully aware of potential obstacles in implementation and/or some new needs may emerge only during project implementation and cannot foresee in the project design stage. For example, SED planning and budgeting reform, decentralization and delegation of SEDP and budget management responsibilities to grassroots administration and agencies... Therefore the donor should work closely with the PMU to identify new needs and adjust Project work plan accordingly to address timely those emerging needs. Organization of midterm review mission In Ninh Binh PAR Project and revision of the Project Document in some extent based on new needs is a good example in this manner.

Fourthly, PAR should be precisely perceived as a long term, persistent and difficult task if significant changes are to occur. Many agencies still see PAR activities as ad hoc and Project specific tasks rather than their embodied needs. Even worse, PAR asks them to perform in a more transparent and accountable manner and threatens their vest interests exploited from the current regime, while their remuneration and/or incentive has not yet improved. Consequently, their involvement in project activities is more formalistic and is directed by an incentive to produce ad hoc required products for projects rather than to apply them seriously in real life. This is a common problem for all PAR related projects. Therefore, outputs and/or outcomes of projects should be distinguished. The first is a group of activities that can produce immediate results that direct link to compulsory PAR tasks that must do nation-wide and/or to day-to-day work performed by government officers but they do not know how to change, e.g. application of OSS models; establishment of community training centers and village common houses; delegation of financial management autonomy to administrative agencies and public service delivery units; change in commune budgeting and improvement of investment management at commune level and so forth) should draw quickly lessons and disseminate their benefits to take advantage of the support from different departments and levels before duplication. The second is a group of activities whose outcomes cannot occur immediately, frequent communication and dialogue with provincial leadership should be enhanced so that they

can understand, appreciate and provide needed institutional support. Projects in Nam Dinh and Cao Bang can be good example in this aspect.

Fifthly, project work plan should be really integrated into annual work plan of implementing agencies including both budget and action plan in order to avoid unnecessary overlapping and waste of scarce resources and to strengthen coordination capacity of public authorities. To do that, local planning capacity should be strengthened and their plan should be resource linked. HBPRP is a good practice in planning reform SPAR-CB is also actively implementing SED planning, sectoral development and annual work planning reform to match with this need.

Finally, all projects are fully aware of the need for a shift in paradigm of leadership and staff members. Usually, staff members greatly recognize need for change while they may hesitate to participate in the change if they do not see equivalent change in their leaders' thinking. Therefore, study tours and experience sharing forum should be frequently held among provinces whose are implementing different PAR projects. Content of those activities and events should tailor to needs and level of local officers. For example, for grassroots staff members, learning from best practice is very effective. In contrast, for top leaders, coordination in organizing summit forum for experience sharing among similar provinces and between local leaders and high profile international experts is more meaningful. All aforementioned project conduct various lesson sharing events for staff members in lower levels, but more effort should be made for senior government officers and local leaders.

3.6 Sources of success

As a PAR related project, achieving Project expected objectives can be attributable to the following factors:

1. The Project has high relevance of its design and implementation to local needs and is put into the general favorable context of the GoV's high commitment to PAR process in Vietnam.
2. Thank for close link of the Project to the overall reform agenda of the central and provincial governments, it has received strong support from local leadership at all levels as well as heads of public agencies involved in Project activities such as OSS and inter-agency OSS models. In meetings with the Vice Chairman of PPC and heads of interviewed agencies, they always showed their consistent support to different PAR models such as "Leaders of Provincial People's Council and Committee are very interested in operation of OSS models" or "The Project has facilitated operation of OSS models". Local leaders also expressed their high valuation of the existence of such project as PAR Project in Ninh Binh. The continuous support and facilitation to Project implementation is also repeatedly emphasized by leaders of People's Committees in all levels.
3. The Project is able to mobilize the participation of vast stakeholders. As analyzed above, the fact that there are 16 implementing agencies, of which three have their own sub-projects, is an evidence for a broad-based participation to PAR Project.

3.7. Obstacles and risks faced

Delays in some Project activities as presented in section 3.4 have negative impacts on the progress of the entire Project and the extent of producing expected outputs. A part of such delays comes from external factors that go beyond control of the Project. However, the other part comes from weak capacity of the PMU and implementing agencies in risk foreseeing, analysis and management..

The lowest controllability is for disaster related risk. In 2008, Ninh Binh suffered a severe flood due to heavy and long lasting rain. Thus, VFF Committee had to devote most of its time and labor force to work with citizen mass in flooding prevention and mitigation, and consequently, the training to strengthen oversight capacity and implementation of sample overseeing activities in three pilot communes can not be held on schedule.

The moderate controllability is for resource mobilization risk (especially human resource) of implementing agencies in Project activities. Again as an example, the fact that VFF Committee had to implement its routine work as guiding villagers to provide assessments on performance of commune officers or retirement of 5 Committee members in 2008 was not taken into account when developing annual work plan of the Committee. This is another source of severe delay in this sub-project.

The highest controllability is for overlapping risk between Project activities and routine work of implementing agencies (e.g. periodical meetings and/or events). This requires the PMU to work in more detail with implementing agencies, instruct them how to develop a comprehensive work plan, in which their professional and technical work is integrated with Project activities to present an overall picture of the entire yearly work load for the management of agency heads.

4. Recommendations

4.1 Strengthening Project relevance and effectiveness

The Project should combine between continuing planned activities in the second half of Phase 2 and drawing important lessons for sustaining its achieved objectives and outputs in the third phase, if possible. This combination will reinforce Project continuation and relevance of the Project to expectation and need of local government and citizenry.

Different OSS models, including inter-agency one (at output level), which have been evaluated as successful effort as analyzed in Finding section, should be duplicated as soon as possible. Nevertheless, since they are in different level of success, a detail study of each OSS model should be conducted to provide a persuasive basis for setting appropriate direction and multiplying roadmap.

The team agrees with DPI's recommendation to the Project for organizing a series of workshops for updating OSS-relevant policies and regulation set by different governmental tiers. Some technical support such as internet networking among three coordinated agencies to accelerate simplification of administrative procedures should be provided.

As mentioned above, improving coordination quality and effectiveness among implementing agencies such as VFF Committee and its member organizations will be a facilitating factor for expected output 5 of the Project to contribute more significantly to achievement of relevant Project objective, provide more recognizable benefits to citizens and reinforcement of grassroots administration. Therefore, the Project should closely monitor implementation of already delayed activities in this expected output and strengthen its coordination with VFF Committee to help this organization to overcome its human resource gap and mitigate emerging risks.

To ensure real contribution of implemented activities to production of expected outputs, some key activities should be more closely followed up, monitored and evaluated. This is extremely important for a series of training courses. As responded by trainees after each training, apart from demonstration of their satisfaction to the training quality, quality of prepared training material and application of active learning process, they also pointed out a lack of systematic after-training following up activities. The main M&E vehicle is through reflection paper prepared by trainees and training evaluation forms. Post-training evaluation (conducted at least 6 months after training ends) should be regularly held to evaluate the extent that new knowledge and methods introduced in training courses is applied precisely and comprehensively in their routine work. Otherwise, it will be very hard to be certain about sustainability of such training.

4.2 Enhancing Project sustainability

The fact that the Project has a large scope of beneficiary agencies and serve multi purposes bears a risk that each agency can be supported just in a few activities that can not provide sufficient momentum for a comprehensive change. Therefore, in the coming year, all Project activities should be re-screened and better performed models and/or activities that have more chance for success and stronger spillover effects for making a real change in the system should be prioritized. Table 3 and 4 below summarizes the team's judgment by objectives and models about the best practice that can be multiplied in period of 2009-2010 and our specific recommendations.

For training activity, if domestic source can provide qualified and experienced consultants, the Project should favor utilizing this source, such as in the field of gender training. By this way, the Project can have cost saving and provide more discretionary room for implementing agencies in consultant recruitment. In addition, Training for Trainers (TOT) should be more emphasized (especially for PIPA) so that provincial trainers can gradually take over training function in Project's training activity. In such TOTs, participants should be equipped with training methods and skills. This approach is very important to the Project sustainability.

A fact that is undeniable is in implementation of PAR activities, public officers in implementing agencies may have to compromise some their own vested interests, expectation for their performance may increase while incentives for better performance are not changed. In the team's point of view, some financial incentive mechanism should be considered in this situation, for instance, application of Decision 61/2006/QD-BTC (as elaborated in Section 4.3). Once new approaches/models demonstrate their firm success and become an integral part in the government system, such incentive mechanism can be removed without harming Project sustainability.

The communication and experience sharing between the Project and MOHA, leading agencies in Ninh Binh province and neighboring provinces, implementing agencies and outsiders should be strengthened to create a common understanding and action taking. In the best hope, models developed within framework of the Project can be recognized by MOHA for nation-wide replication.

4.3 Improving project management quality

More training on SED planning and monitoring, financial management and accounting skills for communes and autonomy-delegating public agencies should be emphasized.

The Project and People's Committees at different levels should consider provision of financial incentive mechanism for PMU staff members. Recently, MOF has issued Decision 61/2006/QD-BTC dated November 02, 2006 on a set of cost norms applied for ODA funded projects and programs. As stated in Article 1, paragraph 1.1.2, "Government officers who are mobilized to work full time in PMUs are eligible for receiving a project management allowance that is equivalent to 100% of salaries and legitimate allowances" and "Government officers who are mobilized to work part-time in PMUs are eligible for receiving a project management allowance of a certain percentage

of their current salaries and legitimate allowances in accordance with their devotion time for project management”.

Table 3: Summary of the team’s judgement on the extent of objective achievements and recommendations for period of 2009-2010, by Project objectives

Objective	Level of achievement	Result	Output	Recommendation for period of 2009/2010
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Objective 1: To pilot administrative reform solutions for improving services that support poverty alleviation	3	Pilot experiences are applied in OSS of Ninh Binh City, Nho Quan district and inter-agency OSS in DPI.	1.1. Study tours on PAR experiences are conducted in Hai Phong, Hanoi, Bac Ninh, Lao Cai, Vinh Phuc, Quang Ninh, Hai Duong and Lang Son.	Examining the replication of OSS models in other provincial and district departments, especially inter-agency OSS for selected public services in DOLISA
		OSS models and community participation in poverty reduction models have great effects in reality.	1.2. Domestic study tours on poverty reduction models are organized in Quang Tri, Ha Tinh and Khanh Hoa.	Identifying mechanism to sustain operation of community participation in poverty reduction model before replication
		Findings in reports are used as basis for preparation of guiding materials/manuals of the Project.	1.3. Baseline studies on current perception of local officers on pro-poor governance and growth principles and current capacity of government agencies related to gender equality and grassroots democracy in five pilot communes are completed.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Evaluating influences of training and effectiveness of training materials ▪ Applying absorbed knowledge and skills in concrete actions
		Customer satisfaction is initially taken into consideration as a criterion for evaluation of public service quality. However, customers have not get used of this feedback mechanism.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A customer feedback mechanism has been developed for selected public services; ▪ A hotline and boxes for getting customers’ comments are established. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Putting feedback mechanism into routine operation and their feedback is reflected in PAR decisions made by public agencies. ▪ Lessons learnt for setting up feedback mechanism for other public services.
Objective 2: To strengthen the organizational	2	Only providing new knowledge, no evidence on application of such knowledge on routine work.	Training courses to strengthen capacity on poverty reduction, consultation skills, participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Emphasizing more on application of new knowledge and skill in daily work.

capacity and human resources of grassroots authorities			promotion mechanism and working skills for grassroots officers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Getting feedbacks on training curriculum to adapt it to local needs before official documentation.
		Resource trainers have not applied active training method in their daily training curriculum.	Training on active training method is held for PIPA's resource trainers is held.	
		There is no evidence on commune officers' application of new technical skills in their work.	Training on technical skills for commune officers is held.	
Objective 3: To support synchronous institutional and organizational reforms to enhance the operational effectiveness and efficiency of all 3 levels of local government	3	Since new process is in drafting stage, its effect on daily work is not showed.	Drafts of Legal Document Issuance and Legal Document Dissemination at commune level has been completed by DOJ.	Providing more support for commune level and DOJ to complete this output.
		Processing time for administrative procedures are shortened and welcomed by businesses, citizenry and government agencies.	Inter-agency OSS among DPI, PDT and Provincial Police has been put into operation. OSS model of Ninh Binh City has been put into operation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Learning lessons and multiply in other public services. ▪ Piloting vertical inter-agency OSS for selected services in DOLISA.
		Result based PAR plans are initially developed by beneficiary agencies. Especially, DOHA's 2009 PAR plan has shown significant improvement.	Two result based management training courses are held; the Result based PAR planning Manual is finalized and training on usage of the manual is held. Ninh Binh Province PAR Plan in 2009 developed as result based is approved.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Following up and monitoring formulation and implementation of result based PAR plans in other agencies. ▪ PPC should consider institutionalization of this approach.
		Once Internal Control Procedures are well complied, transparency and publicity in financial management in autonomy-delegating agencies will be improved.	Training materials and templates for Internal Control Procedures are developed and used in a series of training for autonomy delegating agencies.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Monitoring and supervising the issuance and implementation of Internal Control Procedures in implementing agencies. ▪ Developing feedback mechanisms to improve the

				Autonomy delegation policy in accordance with Decree 130.
Objective 4: To enhance the capacity and participation of women at all 3 levels of local government	1	Some achievements are attributable more to pro-activeness of PWU rather than direct support from the Project.	Study tours on poverty reduction experiences and gender equality are conducted. Workshops on gender integrated planning and monitoring is held.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Given high commitment and pro-activeness of PWU, more support should be provided to this organization based on their proposals. ▪ PWU's needs for capacity strengthening in gender equality should be further examined for Project support to be more need tailoring. ▪ Gender issues should be integrated in SED planning in all levels.
Objective 5: To strengthen the capacity of VFF and its members in monitoring and inspection within the framework of the grassroots democracy decree	1	No clear evidence on achievement since supporting activities to VFF are not implemented in a large scale.	Study tours on coordination experience in oversight of grassroots democracy are held. Training on project management and monitoring is held by the Project with the participation of leaders and staff members of VFF Committee.	Remaining current scope and commitment for supports. No strong evidence for duplication.

Table 4: Summary of the team's judgement on completeness of developed models and replication potentials in period of 2009-2010

Models/pilot approaches	Extent of Achievement	Result	Output	Recommendation for period of 2009/2010
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)

Inter agency OSS model in DPI	4	Processing time for administrative procedures are substantially shortened, inter-agency coordination is significantly improved.	Inter-agency OSS in DPI (among DPI, PDT and Provincial Police) has been put into operation.	Review, learning experiences and duplicate in other public services. Piloting vertical inter-agency OSS model in DOLISA.
OSS model in Ninh Binh City	4	Processing time for administrative procedures are substantially shortened, strongly supported by citizenry, becomes a nest practice for other provinces.	OSS in Ninh Binh City has been developed and put into routine operation.	Duplicating the model in other districts with needed revisions to fit into local conditions.
OSS model in Nho Quan District	3	Processing time for administrative procedures are shortened	OSS in Nho Quan District has been put into operation.	Review and summarize lessons before dublication.
OSS model in commune level	3	Processing time for administrative procedures are shortened	OSS in Gia Hoa Commune has been put into operation.	Review and summarize lessons before dublication.
Community participation in poverty reduction	2	Newly developed model, so that impact is not clear. However, it has great potential of success, especially when it is integrated in other poverty reduction effort in the locality such as implementation of Program 135-II.	Community participation in poverty reduction model has been developed in Thach Binh Commune, Nho Quan District.	Accelerating operation of the model combined with closely monitoring its impacts. Examining potential to apply the model in other poverty reduction programs such as P135-II.
Village Common House	3	Better access of villagers to production and poverty reduction information. The model is strongly welcomed by villagers and they showed their strong commitment to maintain routin operation of the House. Villagers' self-managed spirit is enhanced.	Village Common House has been piloted in Trung Chinh Village, Gia Hoa Commune and Gia Vien District.	Developing mechanism to sustain routine operation of the model, especially in terms of meeting agenda and financial viability before deciding whether duplication is possible.
Community Training Center	3	Information is broadly shared, citizens have better access to updated informations and appreciate benefit of information sharing.	Community Training Centers are established in 6 pilot communes	Imrpoving the model and setting up the clear roadmap for dublication.
Autonomy	2	Efficiency and effectiveness of decree	Templates of Internal Control	Instructing all block granting

delegation to public administrative agencies		130 on autonomy in staffing and administrative spending budget for administrative agencies is strengthened.	Procedures are developed and instructed to block granting agencies.	agencies to implement Decree 130 and develop their own Internal Control Procedures. Providing training for accountants in administrative agencies and autonomous-granting service delivery units.
--	--	---	---	---

5. Appendices

Appendix 1. TORs for consultants

Available in Vietnamese

Appendix 2A. Guideline for focus group discussion and individual interview

A. Interview Leaders of Province, District, and Commune

1. Could you please tell me significance of the Public Administrative Reform project (supported by Norway) to Administrative Reform solutions of Province/District/Commune toward poor people?
2. Do you have any comment about the project? How do you think about the corporation between related agencies in project?
3. Can you give me your comment on poverty alleviation management capacity of cards in selected communes?
4. Could you please show me any figures about poverty alleviation in project and none project areas (for period since project starting until October 2008).
5. Can you give me your comments about recent Internal One Stop Shop model regarding principle, organizing structure, human resource, and management mechanism?
6. How effect from the Internal One Stop Shop model to poor and disadvantage people?
7. Do you collect comments from local people, especial for poor people and woman? If “yes”, how to do? What about complain letter issue (since project starting up to now)?
8. Can you describe the relevance of project to province/district/commune? And your comments about successful of project to administrative reform activities?
9. Do you have any comment about the change of human resource (both qualitative and quantitative) of grass roots level authorities, since project starting up to now?
10. What are matters which province/district/commune has needs but the projects is not yet meet?
11. Recommendations about organizing, administration, finance, and human resource which related to administrative reform?
12. What are supports from local authorities and people to project activities? What is Commitment of People’s Committee on implementing the administrative reform project?

For Gia Vien district: asking about Community Learning Center: model, meaning, advantage, disadvantage, sustainable?

For Nho Quan district: asking about model of Community reducing poverty together: model, meaning, advantage, disadvantage, sustainable?

B. Interview staff of On Stop Shop model of Ninh Binh City, Department of Planning and Investment, and Nho Quan district:

1. Do you know any administrative reform solution of Vietnam and other countries toward poverty alleviation? If possible, please describe.
2. Do you know any good model of administrative reform was found and applied in planning of administrative reform of province, districts, and communes?
3. Please describe activities in the One stop shop model and support from the project to reform administrative procedures and formalities.
4. Have any good model on administrative reform was expanded? If “yes”, please describe.
5. Can you provide me your comments about training activities of the project?
6. Can you provide me your comments about the internal on stop shop model regarding principle, organizing structure, human resource, and management approach.
7. What about cooperation between related agencies?
8. What about meaning of applying One stop shop model? Achievement? Advantage? Disadvantage? Ability of expanding and sustainable?
9. How effect from the Internal One Stop Shop model to poor and disadvantage people?
10. Do you collect comments from local people, especial for poor people and woman? If “yes”, how to do? What about complain letter issue (since project starting up to now)?
11. Could you please describe success of project to administrative reform activities? have any difficulty effecting to achieving objective 1 of project? If “yes”, how do you solve it?
12. Recommendations about organizing, administration, finance, and human resource which related to administrative reform?

C. Interview staff in sub-project of Department of Interior/Department of Justice/Management Board of Industry Area:

1. Could you please describe project activities in your agency?
2. Can you give me your comments about training activities on improving capacity for your staff?
3. Can you give me your comments about support for comprehensive reform regarding intuitional and organizing to improve effective and efficiency of 3 levels of local authorities?
4. Can you tell me about project progress? Project achievement? Advantage and disadvantage in implementing project activities?
5. Can you give me comment about promulgating legal document (regarding timing and reducing overlap)?

6. Do you have any recommendation related to the project?

D. Interview staff of the Provincial Political School

1. Do project activities were conducted as plan? If “No”, reason why?
2. How do you think about support from the project to your school in-term of creating/improving/applying monitoring and evaluation system on training activities?
3. What about gender streaming issue on planning and activities of school?
4. Can you give me your comments about training activities of project? (in-term of timing, content, document, teaching method, role and capacity of trainers, training course result, participant, contribution of participants, relevance of training course, and meaning of training course...).

E. Interview staff of Woman’s Union:

1. Can you tell me the participation and role of woman on project activities?
2. Competition with participation and role of man on project activities?
3. Can you tell me information related gender issue (role, responsibility, power, using income, decision making, and participation on social/family...) in/out project area (priority for project area)?
4. Do project activities were conducted as plan? If “No”, reason why?
5. What about monitoring/supervising activities in project (regarding mechanism, content, frequency, participant, result, feedback, sharing information)?
6. What about support from project to preparation of training document related steering toward poor people, gender issue and development, administrative reform, and grass roots democracy?
7. What about understanding of gender issue in local administrative system? Was gender issue put in administrative reform planning and activities of local agencies and province?
8. Do you think that capacity of For Advancement of Woman Unit and of Woman’s Union is improved? Please describe?
9. Can you provide me figures on percentage of female in agencies in province?
10. What about quality of work of female staff in related agencies?
11. Do you have any recommendation on organizing, administration, financial, and human resource related to objective “Improve capacity and strengthen participation of woman in all three levels of local authorities”?

F. Interview staff of Project Management Unit:

1. Can you describe monitoring and evaluation system in project (process of creating, timing, participant, production)?
2. Were monitoring, supervising, and cooperation activities system identified clearly? Please describe.
3. Do you collect comments from local people, especially poor people and woman? If “Yes”, how do you do?
4. What about comments of people and organizations/associations about provided serviced?
5. What about changing in administrative reform between agencies regarding reducing formalities and more public? What is advantage and disadvantage in the link between PMU and related agencies?
6. Were administrative reform experiences of International and Vietnam introduced, popularity, and discussed?
7. Could you please describe achievements of project on the objective “To support synchronous institutional and organizational reforms to enhance the operational effectiveness and efficiency of all 3 levels of local government”? Do you face any obstruction which effect to implementing this objective? If “Yes”, how do you solve?
8. How do you thing about role of CTA?
9. Do you have any recommendation on organizing, administration, financial, and human resource related to objective “Improve capacity and strengthen participation of woman in all three levels of local authorities”?
10. Can you give me your comment project manual?
11. Can you give me your opinion about project progress?
12. What about advantage, disadvantage, and recommendation on financial issue?

G. Interview Leader and staff of the Vietnam Fatherland Front:

1. Do you thing that capacity of staff in your organization and in member organizations was improved in competition with the time before implementing project? If “yes”, please describe.
2. Was any rural and urban management model with community participation at grass roots level authority drafted and discussed?

3. Can you describe achievement of project for objective “To strengthen the capacity of the Vietnam Fatherland Front and its members in monitoring and inspection within the framework of the grassroots democracy decree”? Has any obstruction which effect to implementing this objective? If “Yes”, how do you solve?

4. Do you have any recommendation on organizing, administration, financial, and human resource related to objective “To strengthen the capacity of the Vietnam Fatherland Front and its members in monitoring and inspection within the framework of the grassroots democracy decree”?

H. Interview beneficiaries:

1. Do you know project which was supported by Norway Government have been implementing in this area? If you know, please describe some project activities

2. Do you have any contacting to Government agencies since implementing project activities (from 1st June 2007 to now)?

3. What about your comments to that contacting (regarding changing of communication, attitude, administrative formalities, traveling time, expenditures, quality of services, satisfactory of client...).

4. Do you will go to those places (Government agencies) for the next time if you want to have other contacting?

5. Do you have any comment about organizing, administration, financial, and human resource related to effectiveness of administrative reform and poverty alleviation?

I. Interview village Leader:

1. Do you have any comment about role of Administrative reform project to local people in this commune/village and about Community together reducing poverty model?

2. What was support from village people to project activities?

3. Can you tell me village’s commitment on mobilizing villagers involving in project activities?

Appendix 2B: Emailed interview questions to CTAs

MID-TERM REVIEW OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION REFORM PROJECT IN NINH BINH

According to the TOR dated 29/9/2008, a Team consisting of two independent consultants is recruited to assist the Project Management Unit to conduct a mid-term review of project implementation. Objectives of the midterm review mission is to assess project progress and the extent to achieve its expected result and predefined objectives.

In order to provide a comprehensive picture of project performance from different angles, the Consultant Team would like to request you – as Chief Technical Advisors of the project – to kindly give us your own opinions related to the following issues:

1. Your assessment on key strengths and weaknesses in:
 - a. Operation, management of PMU
 - b. Coordination of PMU with other project counterparts, including CTAs and the Embassy
2. Models emerged from subprojects/activities within framework of the Project:
 - a. Which model(s)/activity (ies) that you think is/are the most successful and duplicable? Why?
 - b. Which model(s)/activity (ies) that you think is/are the least successful and non-duplicable? Why?
3. Currently, the Project has two sorts of operation modalities: (1) creation of subproject in which the daily operation is managed directly by subproject owners; (2) activities whose operation is directly managed by PMU. Which sort you think is better? Why?
4. Your recommendations/suggestions for the Project in coming years.

Thank you very much for your kind cooperation. We are looking forward for your response. Your reply can be emailed to us through the email address that we sent this request.

Appendix 3. List of participants on individual interview and focus group discussion

List of participant of individual interview

Order	Full name	Position/place
At Provincial level		
1	Mr. Tran Huu Binh	Vice Chairman, Provincial People's Committee (PC) Deputy Officer in Chief, PPC, Director of Inter-agency
2	Mr. Tran Van Khanh	OSS, Ninh Binh City
3	Ms. Ninh Thi Xe	Deputy Director, PWU
4	Ms. Lai Thi Thanh Tâm	Head of Propaganda and Training Unit, PWU
5	Mr. Vu Ngoc Ha	Deputy Director, Department of Interior
6	Mr. Dinh Van Binh	DOHA Head of Administrative Reform and Training Unit,
7	Mr. To Quoc Viet	DOHA Staff of the Administrative Reform and Training Unit,
8	Mr. Nguyen Duc Vu	DOHA Staff of the Cabinet, Administrative Reform and
9	Mr. Nguyen Viet Ha	Training Unit, DOHA
10	Mr. Dinh Van Khoat	Head of Communication Support Unit, PDT
11	Mr. Le Tri Vinh	Director of Department of Justice
12	Mr. Nguyen Duc Ke	Chief of Cabinet, Department of Justice
13	Mr. Tong Hong Quan	Deputy Chief, MUIZ, in charge of OSS
14	Mr. Nguyen Manh Hung	Staff of the Cabinet, MUIZ
15	Mr. Nguyen Tuan Tuong	Deputy Director of MUIZ
16	Ms. Hoa Thi Phuong Lan	Chief of Cabinet
17	Mr. Nguyen Xuan Thuy	Head of Business Register Unit
18	Mr. Pham Hong Quang	President, Provincial VFF
19	Mr. Nguyen Ngoc Vu	Head of Democracy and Law Unit, Provincial VFF Deputy Head of Democracy and Law Unit, Provincial
20	Mr. Dinh Truong Son	VFF
21	Mr. To Thi Tuyet Mai	Staff of the Democracy and Law Unit, Provincial VFF
22	Ms. Pham Thi Thuy	In charge of the Cabinet, Provincial VFF
23	Ms. Dinh Thi Hoang Yen	Staff of the Cabinet, Provincial VFF
24	Mr. Pham Xuan Muoc	Representative of Business Association
At District level		
1	Mr. Nguyen Manh Tuong	deputy Chief of Cabinet, Nho Quan PC
2	Ms. Le Thi Lan Thu	Staff of OSS, Nho Quan District
3	Ms. Hoang Thi Huong Thao	Staff of OSS, Nho Quan District
At Commune level		
1	Mr. Tran Quang Tran	Vice Chairman, Gia Hoa PC Secretary, Head of Administrative Reform Division,
2	Mr. Tran Ngoc Thach	Thach Binh commune
3	Mr. Quach Van Ha	Chairman, Thach Binh PC
4	Mr. Nguyen Cong Su	Staff, Thach Binh PC
5	Mr. Dinh Ngoc Nhien	Vice Chairman, In charge of OSS Division
6	Mr. Tran Xuan Mai	Chairman of Thach Binh PC

List of participant of focus group discussion

Order	Full name	Position/place
Thach Binh commune		
1	Mr. Bui Danh Ton	Head of Trung Chinh village
2	Ms. Nguyen Thi Huyen	Trung Chinh village

3	Ms. Tran Thi Chin	Trung Chinh village
4	Ms. Le Thi Bong	Trung Chinh village
5	Ms. Hoang Thi La	Trung Chinh village
6	Ms. Nguyen Thi Thin	Trung Chinh village
7	Mr. Pham Van Sy	Trung Chinh village
8	Mr. Tran Manh Tien	Trung Chinh village
9	Mr. Dinh Van Quy	Da Han village
10	Mr. Doan Huu Bao	Doi Ngo village
11	Mr. Tran Trong Lam	Gong Vo village

Gia Hoa commune

1	Mr. Quach Thai Son	Bai Lang village
2	Mr. Dao Quang Lien	Doi May village
3	Mr. Quach Van Luc	Ve Chua village
4	Mr. Bui Van Quang	Dam Bong village
5	Ms. Nguyen Thi Hien	Lai village
6	Ms. Vu Thi Huong	Lien Phuong village
7	Ms. Nguyen Thi Son	Tan Thanh village

List of project interviewed consultant

Order	Full name	Position/place
1	Mr. Alf Persson	Project CTA
2	Ms. Hoang Thuy Nguyet	Financial consultant
3	Ms. Vu Tuyet Mai	Consultant on developing manual on Planning and Administrative Reform
4	Ms. Nguyen Thanh Hang	Consultant on evaluating capacity of Political School
5	Mr. Pham Thanh Hung	Consultant of supervising and evaluating community
6	Mr. Nguyen Van Dinh	Consultant on building organizing capacity
7	Ms. Nguyen Quynh Chi	Consultant on Training of Trainer

List of interviewed staff of Project Management Unit

Order	Full name	Position/place
1	Mr. Pham Van Bang	Project Director
2	Mr. ha Thai Duong	Deputy Project Director
3	Mr. Vu Tam Dat	Officer in Chief
4	Mr. Dinh Ngoc Van	Deputy Officer in Chief
5	Ms. Nguyen Thi Hai	Accountant

