# Ethiopia Evengelical Church Mekanes Church Mekane Yesus\_ Development and Social Services Commission/ Wabe Batu Synod Branch Office (EECMY-DASSC/WBS-BO)



# **Community Based Health Services Project (2010-2014)**

(Dodola District)

**Mid-term Evaluation** 

March 4, 2013

Dodola

### **General Background**

Ethiopian Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus Wabe Batu synod branch office is Local NGO Operating in West Arsi Zone, Dodola district, Oromia regional state.

Ethiopian Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus Wabe Batu synod branch office has initiated a community based health service project in cooperation with Norwegian Lutheran Mission in the year 2010 in our zone, Dodola woreda district,

The project focuses on soft ware and the selected thematic areas of the project were water, HIV/AIDS, Family planning and environmental sanitation.

The project is implementing in 4 target kebeles namely, kechema/Chere, wabe-burkitu, Tullu - Aluwanso and Deneba.

The project Agreement for implementation of this project was signed at regional level on 08/10/2010 among Ethiopian Evangelical Church Mekane yesus, Oromia Bureau of Finance and economic Development, and Oromia Health Bureau.

The project has 5 years time frame with implementation period from 2010\_2014 and the estimated budget for the project was 2,500,000ETB distributed over 5 years period. According to the operational plan of the project, in the last two and half years the project has accomplished more of the planned activities. From the planned Budget 1,260,428, an amount of money 1,000,796 ETB has been utilized.

# 2. Objectives of the evaluation

The Mid-term Evaluation mainly intended to review the progress of the project and its achievement in the past two and half years and to provide recommendation on how to accomplish the remaining part of the project in the remaining duration of the project. And also to assess the level of collaboration of the project with concerned government Offices and communities

# 3. Methodology of the Evaluation

- Review of project documents
- Discussion with project management
- Discussion with woreda concerned government offices
- Interviews and discussions were made with the randomly selected beneficiary's communities.

# 4. The Team Composition

The Team was jointly composed of experts from Zonal and woreda project co- signatory offices, and implementing Organization.

# List of participants

Table 1

S/N	Name	Organization	Position
1	Mohammed Dechaso	WAZFEDO	Planning expert
2	Bedasso Efa	WAZFEDO	NGOs Officers
3	Mulugeta Ayele	WAZHO	Expert
4	Zegeye kebede	Woreda FEDO	Expert
4	Abozenea Abera	Wored Health office	HIV/AIDS
			Prevention Expert
5	Gizaw Megersa	EECMY-DASSc	A/ director
6	Leyekun Geletu	EECMY-DASSc	Project coordinator
7	Getahun Tola	EECMY-DASSc	Dev't Com/member
8	Kusha Bencha	EECMY-DASSc	Dev't committee

## 6. General and Specific objectives

# 6.1 General Objective:

The overall objective of the project in the phase is to contribute to improved health status of the target community.

# 6.2 Specific Objective ;-

- To increase access to potable water supply that leads to reduction of water born diseases and reduction of workload on women.
- To create awareness and bring behavioral change on HIV/AIDS prevention and control and reduce its social and economics impact in the target community of Dodola Woreda by the end of the project period
- Increase knowledge, change attitude and practice of using family planning methods among communities in the target Pas of Dodola Woreda
- To established barrier between human excreta other impurities and water sources to avoid contamination. Promote hygiene and health behavior by using latrines with minimum standard.

# 7. Project implementation review of major activities accomplished

- In the past two and half years through 34 session arranged, the project created awareness for 2400 (1277 female and 1123 male) community members in the target pas on safe water mgt.
- The project has been working on purchase and distribution water treatment chemical like "wuha agar water treatment chemical".
- The project has trained 20 WASH committees in the past two and half years to develop the skill of maintaining water point and to develop the skill of income and expenditures managed by them selves.
- The project has trained 46 community Conversation facilitators from the target kebeles.
- In the last half period of the project 5 anti-HIV/ADIS school clubs established and received training in the area of HIV/ADIS prevention

and control methods. The clubs are now functional in the school in that they are organizing different dramas and poems to the school community.

- The project gave training for 8 health extension as per the plan of the project.
- The project gave training for 140 people (stakeholders)on prevention of HIV/ADIS and its impact. The training made a focus on Opportunistic infections, and PLWHS.
- The project raised the awareness on impact of HIV/AIDS for 3569 community members
- Voluntary counseling and testing services has been arranged in the target community. Accordingly, 2842 people got VCT in the target kebeles of the project in the project's half period.
- The project has produced and distributed 50,000 leaflets and posters to the target community as per operational plan. The contenties leaflets are all about HIV/AIDS.
- The project has produced 30training manuals and distributed it to for the anti AIDS clubs and CC facilitators
- Sensitization work shop for community groups (religious leaders, DAs,
   PA leaders and schools teachers ) has been conducted
- Health extension worker training was planed to give to 10 Health extension workers. Accordingly, the project achieved 90% of the plan by trained 9 health workers.
- The project has trained 24 people who could distribute contraceptive to the target community as per the planned.
- 5 model latrines have been constructed at each of the target kebeles.
- Sensitization workshop on environmental health for teachers and students has been conducted for selected 125 people beyond the plan.
- In the half period, period it was planned to established hand washing facilities for 5 schools of the target kebeles. Accordingly, 80% of the plan has been achieved in the period.

# 8. Project implementation review of Physical Plan Vs Accomplishment

# 8.1 The project activities planned and achievements Table -2

S/N	List of Activities	Planned for the		Planned for	Accompli	shed in
		whole project life		the mid	the mid-	project
		(2010-201	4)	project life	peri	od
				(2010-	(201	.0-
				dece31/2012	dece31,	/2012
		unit	Qnt			%
1.1	Safe ware chain promotion awareness	session	74	57	34	59.6
	creation through community meeting in					
	each got(village)					
1.2	Supply of water treatment chemicals	bottle	365000	175000	20,480	11.7
	(bottle)					
1.3	Training of WASH committees (members)	person	20	20	20	100
1.4	Procurement of kits for trained WASH	WASHCO	4	4	4	100
	committee					
2	HIV/ADIS					
2.1	CC facilitators training and incentive	person	80	48	46	95.8
2.2	Anti –HIV/ADIS clubs training and support in	Club	5	5	5	100
	5 schools					
2.3	Training of health workers on PMTCT and	Person	8	4	8	200
	ART					
2.4	Training of stake holder on prevention of	person	150	90	140	155
	HIV/ADIS and its impact					
2.5	Public awareness raising training on impact	person	120	4000	3569	89.2
	of HIV/ADIS					
2.6	Mobile VCT after CC	People	8000	4000	2842	71
2.7	EIC/BCC materials in local language	Pcs	50,000	50,000	50,000	100

2.8	.8 HIV/ADIS training manual production		65	40	30	75
	Subtotal 2					
3	Family planning					
3.1	Sensitization workshop for community	person	850	660	440	66.6
	groups (religious leaders, Das, PA leaders					
	schoolteachers)					
3.2	Health workers extension training	person	16	10	9	90
3.3	Training comm. based contraceptive	person	24	24	24	100
	distributors					
3.4	Incentive for contraceptive distributers	person	96	24		0
3.5	Training of health workers on contraceptive	person	5	5	24	480
	choice					
2.6	Distributions of contraceptives to health	No	15	5	8	160
	institutions					
2.7	IEC/BCC materials production in local	Pcs	50,000	12,000	12,000	100
	language					
4	Hygiene and environmental sanitation					
4.1	Health extension workers training on	person	20	10	10	100
	communication skills					
4.2	Construction of modern latrines	No	5	2	5	250
4.3	Production of slabs through IGA groups	group	5	4	4	100
4.4	Community awareness campaign for HHPLC	PL	5,000			
4.5	Sensitization workshop on environmental	person	32	16	125	781
	health for teachers & students					
4.6	Establishing and washing facilities at schools	NO	4	4	5	125
5	Administrative, procurement,& review					
	meeting					
5.1	Joint annual review meeting	meet		2	1	50
6	Capital Items					
6.1	Procurement of motorbike	No		1	1	100
6.2	Purchase of Laptop	No		1	1	100

6.3	Purchase of Digital camera	No	1	1	100
7	Recurrent expense				
7.1	Motorbike running cost	Ls	1	1	100
7.2	Supervision and technical support from	Round	13	13	100
	DASSC				
7.3	Staff cost(salaries)	Pers/bir	3	3	100
	Staff benefits				
7.4	Provident fund (15%)	Pers/bir	1	1	100
7.5	Medical benefit (3%)	Pers/bir	1	1	100
7.6	Insurance (3%)	Pers/bir	1		0
	Grand total				

# 9. Financial utilization

The project has planned to implement the project with a total budget of 2,500,000 ETB. Which of planned for two and half years was 1,260,428. According to your progress report, a total of Birr 1,000,796.00 was utilized up to dece.31/2012 (79.4%).

Table -3

S/N	List of Activities	Planned for the whole project life		Planned for the mid project life	Accomplished in the mid- project period	
		(2010-2014)		(2010- dece31/20 12	(2010- dece31/2012	
		unit	Qnt			%
1.1	Software chain promotion awareness creation through community meeting in each got(village)	Birr 90,000		56,000	26,100	46.6
1.2	Supply of water treatment chemicals (bottle)	Birr	226,000	74,000	79,533	107.4
1.3	Training of WASH committees (members)	Birr	32,000	32,000	28,499	89
1.4	Procurement of kits for trained WASH committee	Birr	52,000	52,000	54,276	104.3
	Subtotal 1	Birr	400,000	214,000	188,408	88.04 11
2	HIV/ADIS	Birr				
2.1	CC facilitators training and incentive	Birr	140,000	59,500	70,413	118
2.2	Anti –HIV/ADIS clubs training and support in 5 schools	Birr	80,000	80,000	46,413	58
2.3	Training of health workers on PMTCT and ART	Birr	30,238	14,238	12,073	84.7
2.4	Training of stake holder on prevention of HIV/ADIS and its impact	Birr	150,000	56,250	84,263	149.8
2.5	Public awareness raising training on impact of HIV/ADIS	Birr	40,000	15,000	29,190	194.6
2.6	Mobile VCT after CC	Birr	100,000	44,500	23,474	52.7
2.7	EIC/BCC materials in local language	Birr	54,000	54,000	33,044	61.2
2.8	HIV/ADIS training manual production	Birr	40,000	15,000	26,000	173
	Subtotal 2	Birr	634,238	338,488	324,870	

3	Family planning	Birr				
3.1	Sensitization workshop for community groups (religious leaders, Das, PA leaders schoolteachers)	Birr	30,400	17,150	24,819	144
3.2	Health workers extension training	Birr	14,600	3,600	4,301	119.4
3.3	Training 10omm Based contraceptive distributors	Birr	30,000	20,000	18,951	94.7
3.4	Inceptive for contraceptive distributers	Birr	53,700	18,500	28,800	155
3.5	Training of health workers on contraceptive choice	Birr	20,000	12,500	9,993	80
2.6	Distributions of contraceptives to health institutions	Birr	20,000	8,200	4,800	58.5
2.7	IEC/BCC materials production in local language	Birr	48300	19,800	16,380	82.7
	Subtotal 3	Birr	651,700	99,750	108,044	
4	Hygiene and environmental sanitation	Birr				
4.1	Health extension workers training on communication skills		10,000	4,400	4,400	100
4.2	Construction of modern latrines		36,000	14,400	5,000	34.7
4.3	Production of slabs through IGA groups	Birr	83,221	44,500	74,695	167.8
4.4	Community awareness campaign for HHPLC		25,000		0	
4.5	Sensitization workshop on environmental health for teachers & students	Birr	30,000	20,400	16,571	81.8
4.6	Establishing and washing facilities at schools	Birr	14,200	8,400	8,470	100.8
	Subtotal4	Birr	198,421	92,100	109,136	
5	Administrative, procurement, &review meeting	Birr				
5.1	Joint annual review meeting	Birr	68,916	14,400	12,000	83.3
	Subtotal 5	Birr	68,916	14,400	12,000	
6	Capital Items	Birr				
6.1	Procurement of motorbike	Birr	52,000	52,000	75,492	145
6.2	Purchase of Laptop	Birr	13,000	13,000	13,250	102
6.3	Purchase of Digital camera	Birr	5,000	5,000	4,975	93.5
	Subtotal 6		70,000	70,000	93,717	
7	Recurrent expense	Birr				

7.1	Motorbike running cost	Birr	35,000	13,400	11,859	88.5
7.2	Supervision and technical support from DASSC	Birr	192,000	26,482	21,694	81.9
7.3	Staff cost(salaries)	Birr	336000	194,400	89,300	45.9
	Staff benefits	Birr				
7.4	Provident fund(15%)	Birr	50,400	30,240	9,750	32.2
7.5	Medical benefit(3%)		10,080	6,048	592	9.7
7.6	Insurance(3%)		10,080	6,048	0	0
7.7	Severance payment		24,800	14,880	0	0
7.8	Perdiem /allownce	Birr	120,600	72,360	19,951	27.5
7.9	Accountance/Audit)		28,000	16,800	0	0
7.1	Cashier(synod level topup)	Birr	18,800	10,800	3,600	33.3
7.11	Utility	Birr	67,054	40,232	7,875	19.5
	Sub total 7	Birr	892,814	431,690	164,621	38.5
	Grand total	Birr	2,481,389	1,260,428	1,000,796	79.4

# 9. Project fixed Asset

Teble-4 Community Based Health Service Project/CBHSP/ Annual Inventory (Fixed Asset) Count Sheet for the Year 2012

S.N	Description	Qua	Plate no.	Registered	Added in	Deducted	Actual on	Remark
		ntity		on	the year	in the year	Dec.	
				Jan.1,2012			31,2012	
1	Motorbike	1	05-0237	1	0	0	1	Functional
	Yamaha							
2	Lap top	1		1	0	0	1	Functional
2	computer	1		1	U		1	Tunctional
	compater							
3	Digital camera	1		1	0	0	1	Functional
						_		
4	Printer	1		0	1	0	1	Functional
5	BPR table	1		0	1	0	1	Functional
	Total			3	2	0	5	

# 10. Table- 5: Project man Power

S.N	Name	Sex	Position	Qualification	Remark
1	Leykun Geleta	Male	Project Coordinator	Diploma in Nursing and BA in Socialogy	
2	Muluken Belay	Female	A/Cashier	Diploma in Accounting	Working on the bases of top up payment
3	Beriso Racho	Male	A/Accountant	BA in Accounting	Working on the bases of top up payment

# **Project early impact**

As the Mid- term evaluation team observed during filed visit there is evidencing factors that the team would like to forward on this Mid-term evaluation report

The community started using water treatment chemicals as a result of the awareness raised at grassroots level

Number of people seeking VCT has been increased because of the awareness raised in the community.

Number of people seeking for family planning service has been increasing.

# Collaboration with community and stakeholders

The organization has good collaboration with woreda health office by submitting necessary progress reports and communicating in the project implementation. The collaboration with an other concerned governmental office was weak specially, with woreda Finance & Economic development office by timely reporting in the past two and half years project period.

### **Conclusions and recommendations**

# 12.1 Conclusions:

Regarding the project implementation the team observed that the project planned activities were implementing as per the project agreement. According to the operational plan of the project in the last two and half years, the project has accomplished more planned activities focusing on selected thematic areas of the project such as, awareness creation on save water chain management, HIV/AIDS prevention and control, family planning and environmental sanitation.

In the past two and half years through 34 meeting sessions has been arranged, the project created awareness for 2400 (1277 female and 1123 male) for community members in the target area on safe water management.

The project also worked on the awareness rising of supply of water treatment chemicals like "wuha agar" to reduce water born diseases. On this, around 8000 people were got awareness during half life of project period. Following the awareness raising, the project purchased and distributed 20,480 bottles of water treatment chemicals for 6436 community members (3125 female and 3311 male).

The project trained 20 WASH committees in the past two and half years to develop skill of maintaining water points. More over, different types of maintenance tools kits were supplied to these trained WASH committees.

Concerning to HIV/AIDS prevention and control, the project has accomplished different activities in the past two and half years like, training:

Has provided 46 community conversation facilitators from the target kebeles

Has provided for 5 anti HIV/AIDS clubs in the area of HIV/AIDS Prevention and control method

Has provided for health workers on PMTCT and ART

For stakeholder on prevention of HIV/AIDS and its impact, has been provided in the last two and half years of the project period.

Training was given to the different community groups like religious leader, DAS,PA leaders and school teachers on family planning, health extension workers, Training of community based contraceptive providers has been provided by the project. Under hygiene and sanitation health extension workers training on communication skills have been provided.

The total planned Budget for the project implementation was 2,500,000 while the utilized budget during the past two and half years project period was 1,000,796 (40%).

Finally, the majority of the planned project activities has implemented as per the project agreement in the selected target area of 4 kebeles, in the Dodola district.

### 12.2 Recommendations

The evaluation team would like to forward the following recommendations:

The project should improve the collaboration with woreda finance and economics development office by submitting progress report on timely bases in the remaining project period.

The project should create market access to IGA group for effective selling their product.

The project should build staff capacity by providing relatively training to success full project implementation in the remaining of project period.

Water points of Danaba and kachama kebels need close follow up to keep water sanitation.

The project should actively participated people living with HIV/ADIS (PLWH) in training on HIV/ADIS for community to successfully create awareness.

Regular visit to project site and activities is an integral aspect of project implementation and these activities should be strengthened to ensure positive outcomes by the end of project life.

The total Budget of the project which has been planned earlier and the total budget which has listed with activities is not equal. So the project should assure the total project cost for the project life with total budget listed with activities.

The project should strengthen assisting anti HIV/ADIS clubs which established in the school technically and providing necessary support for the successful achievement beyond awareness creation.