

Zhaotong Capacity Building Project  
(ZTCBP)

2010 - 2014

Final Evaluation Report

November 2014

# Contents

Abstract.....	3
Abbreviation .....	4
1. Background .....	5
2. Final Evaluation of the Goals and Objectives .....	5
3. Method of Evaluation .....	6
3.1 Method of literature review .....	6
3.2 Interviewing .....	6
3.3 Observation.....	6
4. Evaluation Findings .....	7
4.1 Project Organization and Management Situation Analysis .....	7
4.1.1 Project Management with Multi-division Responsibility .....	7
4.1.2 Project Management Analysis .....	8
4.2 Community Development Training Target Completion (CDT) .....	11
4.2.1 Effects of Community Development Training .....	11
4.2.2 Community Development Sustainability .....	13
4.3 Survey Result of Domestic Violence Protection (DVP) .....	13
4.3.1 Completion of DVP.....	13
4.3.2 The Difficulties and Shortage of DVP.....	18
4.3.3 DVP Sustainability .....	18
4.4 Children at Risk (CAR) .....	20
4.4.1 Completion of CAR.....	20
4.4.2 Difficulties and Service Shortages of CAR.....	22
4.4.3 CAR Service Sustainability.....	22
5. Analysis / Discussion .....	23
5.1 Women’s Federation Nature Analysis .....	23
5.2 Congenital Deficiency of Project Design .....	24
6. Conclusion and Suggestions.....	25
7. Comments and Feedback.....	29
Annex 1: The Itinerary of Final Evaluation.....	32
Annex 2: Final Evaluation Index System.....	34

## **Abstract**

*The Zhaotong Capacity Building Project (ZTCBP) was funded by the Norwegian Lutheran Mission (NLM) with Norwegian Development Aid (NORAD) as the main funder and carried out by the Norwegian Shincon Kunming office. The goal of the project was “To promote the rights of women and children and improve the situation of abused women and children at risk in the target areas” Towards this goal, the project’s intention was to conduct activities based on awareness raising and advocacy, competence and capacity building in three focus areas: Domestic Violence Prevention, Children at Risk, and Community Development Training. The executive parties included the Shincon Kunming Office (Shincon), the Yunnan Zhaotong Municipal Women’s Federation (ZTM-WF) and on-site project staff. This project’s implementation period was from 2010 to 2014, a total of five years.*

From Oct 27, 2014 to Oct 31, 2014, the Shanghai NPO Development Center (NDC) was commissioned by Shincon to carry out the final assessment for the ZTCBP. The evaluation found that, during the implementation period, this project provided the services of improving the clean water distribution system, developing home biogas systems and carried out various activities in the three focus areas; Domestic Violence Prevention (DVP), Children at Risk (CAR), and Community Development Training (CDT). These activities included: establishing a comprehensive community DVP mechanism, domestic violence training, identification of DVP key people / community volunteer capacity building, anti-domestic violence demonstration site construction work, organizing and guiding communities in large-scale anti-domestic violence campaigns and training, capacity building of teachers, parents, training programs, summer camps and other service organizations. To an extent, the project improved the public services in the project implementation area, increasing the knowledge of community rights and enhancing the awareness of women's rights. However, due to the reality of cultural and political systems, various obstacles such as shortages in the administration of women's organizations, incidences of inadequate project supervision and management experience and other reasons, the overall objective of the project deviated somewhat, with the project results demonstrating hysteresis. Necessary changes of objectives, based on the main goal of the project had to be made to keep the project going smoothly. To improve this project’s ongoing effectiveness, it is recommended to consolidate the results of the project sites, continue emphasis on project services, focus training content on practices, expand self-training, strengthen the project team building efforts and practices, improve project management awareness and enhance the scientific project design and logic framework.

## **Abbreviation**

NLM	Norwegian Lutheran Mission
NORAD	Norwegian Development Aid
CAR	Children at Risk
CDT	Community Development Training
DV	Domestic Violence
DVP	Domestic Violence Protection
NLM	Norwegian Lutheran Mission
WF	Women's Federation
ZTCBP	Zhaotong Capacity Building Project
ZTMWF	Zhaotong Municipal Women's Federation
NDC	Shanghai Nonprofit Development Center

## **1. Background**

*The Zhaotong Capacity Building Project (ZTCBP) was funded by the Norwegian Lutheran Mission (NLM) with Norwegian Development Aid (NORAD) as the main funder and carried out by the Norwegian Shincon Kunming Office. The goal of the project was “To promote the rights of women and children and improve the situation of abused women and children at risk in the target areas”. These objectives were developed to improve public community services and increase women’s and the greater community’s knowledge of their rights for domestic violence prevention (DVP), to strengthen the educational system and strengthen the teachers and the local community’s knowledge and capacity to help children at risk and to lift up their rights for children at risk (CAR), and to improve the quality of life of children and women, and equip the community to contribute to their own development for the community development training (CDT). The executive parties included the Shincon Kunming Office (Shincon), the Yunnan Zhaotong Municipal Women’s Federation (ZTM-WF) and on-site project staff. This project’s implementation period was from 2010 to 2014, a total of five years.*

## **2. Final Evaluation of the Goals and Objectives**

Shanghai NPO Development Center (NDC) was commissioned by Shincon and carried out the final assessment for the Zhaotong Community Development Project (ZTCBP) from Oct 27, 2014 to Oct 31, 2014. The goal of final assessment was to assess and inspect the overall effect of the ZTCBP, including reviewing the completion of indicators of each goal of the project and its sub-projects, its service effect, the experiences and lessons in operation and management, and sustainability of the project etc.

The specific assessment goal is as follows:

- Project Organization and Management: including organizational status of project operation and management, roles and responsibilities at all levels, project services policies and regulations, promotion of project organization and management, project supervision system and project archival records situation.
- Implementation: Input (HR, material, capital etc.), Output and Training (plan, content, implementation, records) etc.
- Effect: the understanding of the objectives of the project, promotion and realization of goals, long-term impact of the project, project sustainability and advice.
- Improvement since issues and advice raised during the mid-term evaluation.

### **3. Method of Evaluation**

Final evaluation of the project was through the use of qualitative research methods, including literature review, interviews, observation and other research methods.

#### **3.1 Method of literature review**

For the final evaluation, we studied the documents of each sub-project onsite, and analyzed and recorded the related data of the basic information about ZTCBP. Referenced literature included: the Project Baseline Survey Report, Project Plan, Project Program of 2010-2014, Project Execution Archives Record (Project Service Plan, Record, and Pictures etc.), Project Mid-term Evaluation Report, Final Evaluation on the sub-project of “Domestic Violence Protection” and other such documents related to the project.

#### **3.2 Interviewing**

The methods of the interviews were through the use of the semi-structured interview questionnaire, with key persons and focus group being interviewed. Related stakeholders such as the Norwegian Shincon Kunming Office project team, Yunnan ZTM-WF project team and three sub-projects’ management teams, executive staffs and service objectives were involved in the interviews.

The key persons of Shicon Kunming Office and Yunnan ZTM-WF were interviewed. NDC gained information on the project’s organization and management, project promotion situation and other such items.

Through the focus group interviews, which involved the three sub-projects’ teams, project staffs, service objects and other stakeholders, NDC came to understand the service effect, project operation, management experience and lessons, project sustainability and other results.

#### **3.3 Observation**

For the final evaluation, the NDC team undertook field research at seven project sites of the three sub-projects to observe the effects of the program.

## **4. Evaluation Findings**

### **4.1 Project Organization and Management Situation Analysis**

#### **4.1.1 Project Management with Multi-Division Responsibility**

Executive parties included Shincon, Yunnan ZTM-WF, Project Site Staffs etc. During the implementation of the project, a multi-division project management plan had been established for the development and implementation of the project.

As the funder and regulator, Shincon cooperated with local partners to implement the project according to the plan. Based on field surveys and this project plan, ZTM-WF designed an annual executive program which was presented to Kunming Shincon to approve and then signed an agreement with Shincon which clarified each party's responsibilities and obligations. Shincon managed and supervised the project by training, inspections and communication with ZTM-WF during the project period. As the project executive partner, the role of ZTM-WF was to manage, organize, coordinate, and supervise the implementation. Three departments of ZTM-WF were assigned these responsibilities, and worked as bridges to contact and communicate with each project site. The City and Countryside Department of ZTM-WF coordinated and managed the sub-project of "Community Development Training", which was implemented in Goujiao Village Jiandi township and Zhuanshanbao Village Xinjie township; The Zhaotong Women and Children Working Committee Office coordinated and managed the sub-project of "Children at Risk" which was implemented in the QGL (Qinggangling township) Demonstration Primary School in Zhaoying District and Ciyuan Primary School in Ludian Village, Zhaotong City; The Rights Division of ZTM-WF coordinated and managed the sub-project of "Domestic Violence Protection" which was implemented in Zhuquan Community in Zhaoyang District, Bishan Community of Daguan County and Baojian Community of Ludian County in Zhaotong City.

The Women's Federation is organized by hierarchical structure at municipal, county, district and township levels. ZTM-WF is in the municipal unit, and therefore in an

advantageous position to communicate with the lower levels of organization. In each project site, staff in charge of community/village and school were involved in the project actively, and coordinated with each delegated department to carry on the project successfully.

As the main component of the project, training was carried out by the cooperation of Shincon, ZTM-WF and the sub-project sites. According to project plan, Shincon communicated with ZTM-WF and the sub-project sites in the design and subjects of the training. Shincon was also responsible for contacting trainers. ZTM-WF was in charge of organizing the staff on the project sites. Besides participating in the training provided by Shincon, each project site also developed self-training other training information.

#### **4.1.2 Project Management Analysis**

##### **(1) Strong Sense of Project Quality Management**

With the implementation of the project, we found there was deviation from original planning. Shincon had to actively communicate with local partners to evaluate and improve the actual situation. The initial project work was developed by ZTM-WF, and the sub-project of “Domestic Violence Protection” focused on consultancy with less contact with community women. In the mid-term evaluation report, the head of Rights Division in ZTM-WF explained the actual situation to Shincon directly after the first training. Shincon reevaluated the local needs including the environment evaluation, then redesigned the input and output, and adjusted the focus gradually.

The training subject, real needs-based training, was confirmed based on field studies in cooperation between Shincon and ZTM-WF. The sub-project of “Community Development” initial training was only suitable for village leaders, rather than normal villagers. Subsequent trainings more closely related to the life of villagers were launched, such as; burns, diarrhea, smoking & health, the scientific use of chemical fertilizers and pesticides, soil protection and others.

For the sub-projects of “Domestic Violence Protection” and “Children at Risk”, baseline surveys had been launched to understand the problems and needs of the project, in order to design the activities. End line surveys were used to analyze the service effects through before-and-after comparison. Additionally, Shincon organized experts to evaluate the “Domestic Violence Protection” sub-project’s effects, in order to improve its subsequent orientation.

### **(2) Project team-building need to be improved**

The stability and quality of project people is very important for a project’s operation and management. During the implementation, the staff in the *Norwegian Shincon Kunming Office* who managed the sub-project of “Domestic Violence Protection” changed, resulting in different project management mindsets. This caused inconvenience in communication among all of the parties. During the project period, Shincon relied on ZTM-WF to manage and supervise the implementation, and did not provide clear and consistent guidance. Thus, the project parties had different understandings as to the targets, objectives and project management. This caused different effectiveness of services for each project site.

To improve the sense of rights of women and children at the project sites, professional and systematic training and practices needed to be shown in the respects of concept, content and implementation. Trainers were provided by the project management, but there was little professional backup; the training needs more systematic improvement.

### **(3) File Management need to be improved**

File management is basic to project implementation, and it is necessary to record all project documents including contracts, work plans, project activities, project summaries etc. File management is needed for evaluation as project documents help management analyze and summarize the experience, and provide project supervision a tool for self-examination. Good record-keeping by management of a project ensures that project management capabilities continue to improve and sustain. As to the situation of incomplete file records, Shincon took the advice from ZTM-WF and invited professionals

to instruct and address the file management in Zhuquan Community and develop a case management form based on the actual situation. The file management was found detailed, formal and orderly in the final evaluation, and the training records, training attendance, promotional materials, promotional communications, domestic violence reception record, cases of domestic violence and other archival material had been sorted and filed clearly. Besides the case mentioned, ZTM-WF had required the other two project sites of “Domestic Violence Protection” to improve their file management.

However, as the main responsible party, Shincon company needed to create the policy to improve the file management focus on training content, training plans, training development, training summary and training material records and such.

## 4.2 Community Development Training Target Completion (CDT)

### 4.2.1 Effects of Community Development Training

The City and Countryside Department of ZTM-WF coordinated and managed the sub-project of “Community Development Training”, and provided the services of building water tanks, a water pipe system, and community development training in Goujiao Village Jiandi and Zhuanshanbao Village Xinjie townships. This provided convenience and benefit, improving the quality of life for local women and children, attaining the project target.

**Chart 1 Sub-project of Community Development Training Completion**

Year	Implementation	Location	Notes
2010	Shincon invested 199,500 RMB and built 133 water tanks, the beneficiaries a total of 648 people in 133 households.	Goujiao Village of Jiandi township, Ludian County	Shincon subsidized each water tank at 1500 RMB, and each farmer invested labor and money at about 1500-4500 RMB.
2011	Shincon invested 128,000 RMB and built a 6.4km long water pipe system, the beneficiaries were a total of 768 people in 182 households.	Zhuan Shanbao Village of Xinjie township, Ludian County	
	Shincon invested 250,000 RMB, the beneficiaries were more than 3530 people of 861 households.	Goujiao Village of Jiandi township, Ludian County	Beneficiaries are more than 1800 livestock.
2010-2012	Shincon invested 125,000 RMB and built 50 biogas systems, the beneficiaries are 50 households.	Zhuanshanbao Village and Pingdiying Village in Xinjie township, Ludian County	25 biogas systems were built in each of 2 villages.
2010-2014	Shincon and ZTM-WF cooperatively organized 13 sessions of training the beneficiaries are more than 1280 people.	Goujiao Village of Ludi township and Zhuanshanbao Village of Xinjie township in Ludian County	Training involved building, managing and using water systems, biogas systems etc., information on burns, diarrhea, health issues, community development and civilization quality etc.

The effects of sub-project of “Community Development Training” is shown as follows:

**(1) Enhanced the quality of life for local women**

With the implementation of water tanks and a water pipe system, local women do not need to travel uphill a few kilometers for water, thereby reducing the time and energy required for its procurement. At the same time, local people changed unhealthy living habits such as rarely showering, not washing feet, and sharing the same pot of water among families, reducing the incidence of intestinal, gynecological conditions and other diseases. The use of biogas renewable energy provided convenient cooking conditions, and changed the traditional rural way of life to a clean green energy mode, improving the quality of life of farmers, and helping improve the local environment.

**(2) Enhanced women's life skills**

With the training related to water systems, biogas management and safe use, fertilizer/ insecticide proper use and environment protection, burns, health issues, quality of civilization and such, local women’s life skills were enhanced. Especially notable was the financial management related training provided by ZTM-WF, which helped community women master skills to help improve their family’s financing capacity.

**(3) Optimized community and promoted local economic development**

The establishment of water and biogas systems optimized local agriculture and provided convenience for the raising of pigs and sheep. Local women, now freed from fetching water, have more time to engage in farming and aquaculture etc., and increase their incomes. The building of water systems not only solved the drinking water problem, but also promoted the farming, aquaculture and courtyard economies. After the installation of a biogas system, the beneficiary can save 2,000 RMB annually. Local farmers can save the fuel cost of 1200 RMB a year with energy-saving stoves. Biogas slurry and biogas residue is used as fertilizer, also increasing income. The implementation of the project has positive influence in maintaining the water and soil ecology, reducing soil erosion and improving the agricultural ecological environment. This has the positive effect of ecology promoting development and conversely, development promoting ecology.

## **4.2.2 Community Development Sustainability**

Before the project started, many families, with the help of the local government, had established water tank and biogas systems. The construction of biogas and water systems by the sub-project is in supplement to the local government infrastructure. The main feature of the sub-project was, on the basis of promoting infrastructure, a focus on the training of water and biogas system safe management. Meanwhile, life skill training of villagers was launched. Burns, smoking & health, diarrhea, community development, civilization quality were among the topics covered. The various topics helped local residents master the knowledge of a healthy and civilized lifestyle.

ZTM-WF provided training related to hygiene and the life skills necessary for local women to master production and development, domestic services, food service skills and such, so that women can stay at home and produce or work locally, reducing the number of migrant workers, and as a result, reducing the number of left-behind children.

## **4.3 Survey Result of Domestic Violence Protection (DVP)**

### **4.3.1 Completion of DVP**

Shincon and the Rights Division of ZTM-WF worked together to implement the DVP scheme, DVP Key People Training, Volunteer Capability Building and Community Anti-Domestic Violence Information Site etc. in Zhuquan Community in Zhaoyang District, Bishan Community in Dagan County and Baojian Community in Ludian County, Zhaotong City, and organized the three communities to develop the large anti-domestic violence campaign and key people training.

The detailed implementation is as follows:

### **(1) Anti-Domestic Violence Comprehensive Planning**

With the help of ZTM-WF, an anti-domestic violence comprehensive plan had been set up in each of the three communities. This was a cooperative effort between the WF, the community leadership, the judicial system, the public security system and the media. The effort provide the basic frame and policy for the DVP service team, work plans and service policy etc., and laid the foundation for DVP work.

Anti-Domestic Violence teams made up of community leadership and resident volunteers (incl. male & female) were established in the three test communities. There were at least 3 people responsible for Anti-DV work in each community; there is also a coordinator chosen in each community to collect information and deal with the issues. An anti-domestic violence work flow was set up, composed of the Women's Rights Network, a Community Domestic Violence Complaint Flowchart, a Community Women Rights Team, a Community Family Violence Complaint and Acceptance flowchart, a Community DVP System, a Community DV Key Door Investigation and Management System, a Community DV Commission Site Work Policy and a Community DV Receiving System. A DVP station, complaint line and DV Treatment Room (谈心屋) were set up to deal with DV issues, which provided women a help center and created a good atmosphere for DVP.

With WF as the core, the test communities as the unit, and the cooperation of the WF, community leaders, the judicial system, the public security system, the hospital system and the media as the base, the DVP Comprehensive Service Scheme has been improved continuously, and plays an active role even after the project completion. As to the local cooperation, in order to ensure that DVP work continues developing after the project completion, ZTM-WF will mobilize community support in DVP and enhance the capability building training, and help volunteers and work staff to promote knowledge and skills in DVP work, to provide continued and better support and service for people in need.

## **(2) DVP Key People Training**

Within the project period, Kunming Shincon and ZTM-WF worked together to provide 21 sessions of special training for DVP leaders and volunteers, involving the topics of DV Basic Information, Comprehensive Scheme Building, DVP, Activities Design, Basic Consulting Skills, Case Management Tools and more. Shincon also organized DVP key people from test communities in Dengfeng of Henan, Xishan and Songming of Kunming to visit the advanced mode of DVP and relate advanced experience, resulting in the improvement of the awareness of DVP, and the service abilities of key people and volunteers. Each project site developed self-training on the basis of their participation in the training provided by Shincon, in the way of sharing information, participatory learning, experience sharing etc.

According to feedback from DVP community leaders and volunteers onsite, the training helped people improve their understanding of DV, their knowledge of how to treat abusers, how to deal with and prevent DV issues, how to independently organize DVP training and propaganda, how to provide psychological counseling for callers and give abused women help and support. There are professional people in place providing counseling and assistance when abused women go to WF for help, thus provide a supportive community environment full of equality, respect and safety. The project has improved the awareness of DVP, the service abilities and work levels for key people and volunteers.

## **(3) Raising Awareness of Women's Rights**

In order to prevent and stop domestic violence and improve project effects, ZTM-WF cooperated jointly with the Zhaotong City Comprehensive Management Office, the ZT Municipal Court, the ZT City Procurator, the ZT Municipal Public Security Bureau and the ZT Justice Bureau to on the policies "Suggestion on Zhaotong City Domestic Violence Prevention and Suppression" and "Suggestion on Implementation of Zero Domestic Violence Model Community". The WF promoted at the same time, through inter-news broadcasts, SMS, TV and public service advertisements "Women's Rights Protection Law" and "Marriage" campaigns that closely related to women's rights and other laws and regulations, promoted gender equality, created the atmosphere of anti-domestic

violence, and improved regional and national anti-domestic violence awareness. These media campaigns, together with the contents of the anti-domestic violence programs, services, and knowledge enhanced the publics' attitudes and awareness of domestic violence issues in Zhaotong City.

During the project, the three communities utilized important holidays such as "3.8", Women's Rights Week, "Social Security Awareness Month", "12.4" Legal Publicity Day, "11.25 International Day Against Domestic Violence" and other major festivals in their promotion efforts. Through issuing proposal of "Anti-Domestic Violence to Promote Harmony" statements, calendar painting activities, anti-domestic violence guide booklets, on-site consulting, community bulletin boards and other activities, the promotion of domestic violence awareness and prevention were disseminated. At each project site, community women obtained basic knowledge of DV, how to find help, how to prevent domestic violence and other such information. After training, WF leaders and volunteers obtained knowledge of gender equality, the promotion of DV awareness and the knowledge of how to deal with DV issues from the perspective of gender. As a result of these activities, residents of the community increased their concern and response to DVP, and actively join the volunteer teams.

#### **(4) Work Capability of Women Federation Improving**

Through their work in the project's operation and management, and their participation in the training process, WF leaders and staff at all levels have a broadened awareness of representing and protecting the rights of women and children, and the promotion of gender equality. They have learned to listen, empathize and respect, and are better able to treat abused women of domestic violence, and are better equipped to handle the effects of domestic violence incidents. They involve the new DVP knowledge and skills into their daily work, which is then actively publicized. The WF at all levels has gained an increased ability in organizing group activities, developing large events, and an increase in the ability to address more victims of domestic violence. The ZTM-WF now has more focus on domestic violence, from exploring the regularity of cases, to the introduction of policies and regulations.

## **(5) Unique Features of Different Project Sites**

As the important work of WF, DVP has formed unique features in each of the three project sites.

A notable feature of the Zhuquan Community is its regulated and systematic file management. The project site also incorporated DVP knowledge into entertainment activities, making drama, poetry and jingles to promote DVP advocacy. Male volunteers were encouraged to become involved, the recruitment rate of males reaching one third. One of the male volunteers was an abuser to his wife, and after training, continued working as a long-time volunteer to prevent domestic violence.

Bishan Community of Dagan County is in a remote area, facing many difficulties. The community team made use of a community cooperative at its DVP site, calling on abused women to come to learn handicraft techniques and use the mutual strength and support of the team to solve DV problems. At the same time they relied on the community service platform and mechanisms of the local China Communist Party to publicize women's rights and DVP information into community outreach, making use of art teams, large-scale cultural activities and other campaigns to reach the community. Retired leaders assumed responsibility for DVP work and set up the "Sister Chen Room" to treat abused women, and continued by carrying out related training in the community. They also were able to integrate the local judiciary, police and other systems into their anti-domestic violence comprehensive mechanisms by the authority and resources of communities' leaders. At the same time, as a local authority, there is a certain effect and influence to persuade and stop male abusers.

The main feature of Baojian Community in Ludian County is its effectiveness at promoting DVP. This project site launched awareness campaigns during women's, DVP and other holidays, making use of large events, mailings, proposals, booklets and other media to achieve obvious effect. It was reported that the other two communities visited Baojian community to learn their successful experiences at promotion.

### **4.3.2 The Difficulties and Shortage of DVP**

Because of the large differences between communities in infrastructure, facilities, degrees of local domestic violence etc., there are differences in the effects and features of DVP and treatment, and the relevant integrated work planning, project file management levels, domestic violence advocacy efforts, and effects of project implementation.

The providing of counseling for abused women is still mostly carried out with a focus on mediation, on trying to reach a "family harmony". The efforts to promote the idea that perpetrators be held accountable for their acts of violence, and to instill the awareness of women's rights are still inadequate. In order to promote women's rights, women need to be empowered, and allowed to use their power in practice, and be provided the opportunity and platform to protect their rights.

### **4.3.3 DVP Sustainability**

Each project site optimized its DVP and treatment scheme to play a continuous constructive role in its community. First, the project held trainings involved updating knowledge about women's rights and domestic violence and reshaping the concept of family violence prevention and intervention, focusing that the project's work was carried out in the aspects of respect, equality, prevention, with involvement and improvement in organizational ability. Secondly, the projects optimized the DVP project teams and integrated the community women's federations, community leaders, the judicial system, the public security system, the hospital system and the media system to be involved in domestic violence prevention and intervention, creating a more effective comprehensive DVP platform with more channels of help for abused women. Then, establishment of basic domestic violence prevention and intervention sites and facilities for the reception and treatment of victims of domestic violence, and protocols through a standardized anti-domestic violence workflow chart had been facilitated. Finally, participatory training enhanced WF staffs' work ability in communication and presentation, improving work

methods and enhancing the understanding of the concept and skills of DVP in a scientific way.

As to the project's local partners, ZTM-WF will seek local government and community support to ensure DVP efforts continuously develop, and strengthen DVP capacity building and training for the knowledge and skills of volunteers and project teams who serve people in need. WF will continue to carry out anti-domestic violence public awareness campaigns on holidays and promote DVP knowledge, methods and skills in order to get more people involved. As a result of the project sites, other communities were encouraged to set up DVP teams and offices. Shincon's DVP model sites are really playing a leading role in area DVP.

The eleven townships and communities of ZTM-WF have set up DVP model sites with the guidance of the three project sites, and WF arranged the key people of the three sites to promote DVP experience.

## **4.4 Children at Risk (CAR)**

### **4.4.1 Completion of CAR**

The Zhaotong Women and Children Working Committee Office coordinated and managed the sub-project of “Children at Risk”, and implemented the work in QGL (Qinggangling Township) Demonstration Primary School in Zhaoying District and Ciyuan Primary School Ludian Village Zhaotong City, providing the services of Teachers’ Capacity Building, Parents’ Capacity Training, Summer Camp and other activities.

The many services strengthened the local teachers’ teaching skills, and enhanced the ability at private tutoring of custodians of CAR. These services also provided children a good environment to study, and increased comprehensive quality and ability of CAR efforts.

#### **(1) Raised Local Teachers’ Capabilities**

Within the project period, Shincon organized 50 key teachers from two schools to participate in seven trainings sessions of different topics in Kunming, Beijing and Guangzhou. The teachers underwent many various capacity building activities including training in child care, interviews, life skills training, “teacher’s” training and such, in addition to observing and learning new teaching methodologies. On the basis of their experiences, the two schools self-organized training to promote new knowledge, new ideas and new thinking of how to work and improve the standard of their teachers.

The teachers who participated have gained improvement in their teaching attitude, teaching methods, teaching confidence, teaching management and other aspects of their abilities, and are now gradually exploring the transition from traditional teaching to a more diversified educational model.

#### **(2) Strengthened Home Education / Ability of Custodians**

Shincon organized five training sessions for parents under the topic of Children’s Value, Children Care Skills, Needs and Rights of Children and such, the beneficiaries being more than 400 people. Through the training, parents got to know the importance of parenting,

and increased the sense of their responsibility as parents, their sense of children's entitlement and learned the scientific ideas and methods of home education and parent-child communication. Some parents had given feedback before the training, expressing that they thought parents had the supreme right and authority over children, having given birth to raising them, they felt they should treat children as they like. But this result brings rebelliousness and barriers in communication; after the training, parents recognized that they must treat children as friends and listen to their opinion and regard their viewpoints, in order to more effectively communicate with, and thus understand children.

### **(3) Improved CAR Studying Environment**

Shincon worked with ZTM-WF to organize ten summer camp activities. By playing games, being involved in music, painting, physical education, reading, the children attending cultivated and developed good habits for study and life. Some students were changed in their character; isolated children opened up, weak self-control ability was strengthened, rudeness and disrespect for others was addressed. Some changed in habits; the enthusiasm for learning, lack of ambition, study and work completion habits were improved.

The two schools set up "Private Message Box" systems to collect children's feedback. From their training, teachers learned how to communicate with students in a more effective way and learned how to encourage students to study, thereby creating a better learning environment. The schools improved their course systems, adding more games and activities during breaks and P.E. classes. For example, Qing Gangling Elementary Demonstration School optimized school courses to achieve specialization of national courses, standardization of local courses, and humanity of school-based courses. Shincon provided schools certain funding to improve teaching facilities, e.g. Shincon funded Qing Gangling Elementary Demonstration School eight book cabinets to give children chances to read more books, and built 20 dormitories for Qinggangling School teachers to give them convenience in teaching and life.

#### **4.4.2 Difficulties and Service Shortages of CAR**

The project plan was to serve the children at risk, but in practice provided services to all the students in the school. According to the feedback of the project team, most students are left-behind children who have many difficulties in life and learning. The main content of the training program was to train school teachers, and after enhancing teaching skills and attitudes, the teachers could better serve more left-behind children. The project indicators of "Regular meetings between school personnel, WF, volunteers and village", "Setup School Management Committee to strengthen the relationship and cooperation between schools and communities" has not been implemented. Therefore, some project targets were hard to realize, such as "children grow up in the local community safely" and "relations and cooperation between schools and communities, communities and schools are strengthened, communication between schools and nursing closer".

#### **4.4.3 CAR Service Sustainability**

The project trained a team of key teachers in teaching skills, methods and attitudes. These effects will be sustained for students of both schools over the teacher's careers. The trainees will also pass their teaching experience to other teachers, thus expanding the influence of the project.

## **5. Analysis/ Discussion**

### **5.1 Women's Federation Nature Analysis**

As the bridge and bond of the female masses, the Women's Federation is committed to representing and defending women's rights, promoting equality between men and women as well as maintaining the rights and interests of children and adolescents. This project aims to promote the rights and interests of women and children and improve living conditions of victimized women and children, which is basically in line with the functions of Women's Federation. The municipal level ZY-WF presented a relatively high engagement in this project, which laid a sound foundation for its smooth implementation.

As a public organization, Women's Federation is logically supposed to develop into an autonomous organization independent of government's authority. However, the present-day Women's Federation in China is still heavily bureaucratic: while exercising its functions it still depends largely on government, which intervenes too much in its daily operation. This overdependence and excessive intervention actually present a stumbling block to the Women's Federation's autonomy. In fact, China's government has burdened Women's Federation with part of its responsibilities that should have been taken by its Women and Children's Working Committee. Due to the overlapping of responsibilities, Women's Federation is heavily tainted by bureaucracy in terms of its working logic and methods. Given the complex nature of Women's Federation, the implementation of the activities in this project often ended up being a passive completion of tasks from superior officials, devoid of the perspective of the overall projects aims and its sustainable development. As the mid-term assessment reported, in the implementation of the sub-project CDT, Jingjiao Village (in Jiangdi town, Ludian County) was selected by the ZY-WF and the Ludian WF as one of the project sites for the mere purpose of alleviating its poverty with the acquired resources.

Thanks to ZY-WF's support, this project was carried out relatively smoothly. Due to the consistency of this project's content with the Women's Federation's mission, this project achieves its basic objectives. Despite this however, the overall objective of this project

has not been met due to the over-scattered and irrelevant implementation of the three sub-projects in seven communities.

## **5.2 Congenital Deficiency of Project Design**

The three sub-projects were carried out separately in seven communities or villages, resulting in loose connection and communication between each project. Regionally independent operation of the three projects only yields irrelevant and regional effects, which contributes little to the materialization of the general goal---to improve public service of communities, to promote women's awareness of rights and interests and to enhance knowledge of rights' protection in communities.

For example, the CAR program is not completely carried out with the view of project objectives. As a public welfare project targeted at social benefits, the CAR program should be executed through a series of interrelated tasks to achieve one or a few goals. Therefore, the project design of activities or services needs connecting with each other logically. Shincon company should design the project with reference to program logic model (PLM) theory while taking into consideration seven aspects---the project situation analysis, theoretical assumptions, external environment factors, resources distribution, activities and services, service effectiveness and the logical relationship between each link to enhance the scientifically based effectiveness of the project plan. The design of this project is grounded in certain aspects such as the project situation analysis, external environment factors analysis, resources distribution, activities and services, presenting a clear exposition of the project implementation background and planned activities. However, the project needs enhancement in such aspects as theoretical assumptions, service performance and the logical relationship between each link. Short of basic program logic, the project design has not clearly expounded the connection between the project activities and the relevant theoretical basis on ability construction. As a result, consensus is difficult to reach on clarified project objectives, inter-links and exchanges between sub-projects and internal logic between each activity.

## 6. Conclusion and Suggestions

Based on three sub-projects (CDT, DVP AND CAR), this project provided services in three fields:

*First*, it offered services in community development by organizing trainings such as construction of water projects, pipe engineering and community development training.

*Secondly*, it attempted to establish an anti-domestic violence mechanism, organized anti-domestic violence workers' and volunteers' training and promoted anti-domestic modelling and education in communities.

*Thirdly*, it provided training services to teachers and parents and organized summer camps.

As a whole, this project has improved the community's public service, raised women's awareness of rights and interests and enhanced knowledge about rights and interests in communities.

We give **suggestions** as follows:

### **(1) Fortify project's achievements & pay continuous attention to project's service**

This project has contributed to the construction of public facilities, improvement of working mechanisms and enhancement of faculty capabilities. We advise that Women's Federation continue to give support and instruction to the project's programs, the DVP program in particular, by tapping into more social resources from related parties. For example, there should be sustaining support to DVP in order to improve the comprehensive service system in all the project sites; more advocacy to government agencies in organizing more CDT trainings; more financial resources from local educational institutions to fund care programs and extracurricular activities for left-behind children and to create safer living environments for them.

### **(2) Amplify training and extend the coverage of beneficiaries**

This project provides various kinds of trainings to the attendees, updates their conceptions and improves their abilities. We suggest that the core staff in the project sites amplify these trainings to the communities' residents, thus promoting new concepts and ideas.

### **(3) Pay attention to the cultivation of ability**

Since Shincon's funding for the project is periodic, it is only through promotion of the abilities and effects of the project sites that the lasting influence of the project can be ensured. We advise that the training should be focused on ability cultivation within ZY-WF in such respects as project management and project financing to strengthen ZY-WF's consciousness on, and their ability to promote the rights of women and children.

### **(4) Be practice-oriented in training**

Most of the attendee personnel responded in assessment feedbacks that "participatory methods and concept" left a deep impression on them because of its practicality, but make little mention of actual content transmitted in programs such as community development, domestic abuse prevention, and child protection. Therefore we advise that sections on how to operate sub-projects in communities should be added to the project training.

### **(5) Strengthen the construction of project team**

Given the fact that during the period of project, Shincon's high personnel instability has hindered project communication to a large extent and that Shincon has not set up a professional team of training teachers, we suggest that Shincon strengthen the construction of their project teams to ensure the smooth operation of future projects and gradually build up a reserve of a professional team of training teachers with the project underway.

We also suggest strengthening internal team training and learning, updating the concept of project operation and management and enhancing professional project management

to guarantee the effects of projects. Shincon should establish stabilized executive teams to reinforce the research and summary of similar projects; constantly sum up the experiences of project to increase the scientific and professional levels of project design and operation; establish professional teams consisting of training teachers, experts and counselors to promote the standardization and effectiveness of project operations; seek professional organizations to give comprehensive courses on core sections; actively learn from cooperation with other professional organizations which have experience in providing services and training on CAR and DVP.

#### **(6) Strengthen consciousness on project management**

As a project planning book lays the basis of project operation and management, it is only through the smooth implementation of a project planning book that project goals can be achieved. In the course of a project's implementation, the project team should accurately identify the assisted subjects and provide them with access to services that cater to their needs, thus achieving the purpose of protecting vulnerable children and women's rights; continuously monitor the project underway to reach a consensus on project objectives and the assisted subjects among all the related parties, which lays the very foundation on achieving project plan; on the basis of the annual plan, develop the project management system containing the project management principles and regulations. At the same time, as the main body in charge, Shincon should provide clear guidance to the executive body in project sites in aspects such as identification of the assisted subjects, project implementation and project goals-setting.

We also advise that the grand project should be intertwined with the concept and method of evaluation in the course of the project design, project implementation and post-project, with special attention paid to internal project monitoring and evaluation.; concentrate on the construction of a management system made up of schedule management, quality management and file management to institutionalize project management and operation.

## **(7) Enhance the science and logic of the project design**

Given that the three sub-projects are carried out separately on independent sites, we suggest that three sub-projects be implemented, as far as possible, within the same community or village to achieve joint operations of the three sub-projects in a comprehensive mechanism. Shincon should design the project with reference to program logic model (PLM) theory while taking into consideration seven aspects---the project situation analysis, theoretical assumptions, external environment factors, resources distribution, activities and services, service effectiveness and the logical relationship between each link---to enhance the scientific based effectiveness of the project plan. Among the seven aspects, special attention should be paid to the theoretical assumptions, service effectiveness and the logical relationship between each link; substantiate the project's situation analysis, theoretical assumptions and the external environmental factors analysis with evidence; accurately describe the project's problems and needs, hypothesis and the feasibility of project operation; resources distribution, activities and service performance should be effect-oriented, logic-based and interlocked to logically present the procedures and path that each activity undertakes to achieve its designed effect.

## 7. Comments and Feedback

Evaluations are mostly about learning. They provide great opportunity to improve subsequent project administration by consolidating in one place the lessons applicable to improve the ongoing projects or which apply to other situations.

Within the timeframe of the evaluation process, it is simply not possible to gain an entire awareness of how a program has progressed, the obstacles it has faced nor how it has evolved. Feedback after an evaluation is an important step in gaining more complete knowledge for everyone involved.

On review of the initial project report prior its finalization by NDC, feedback and comments by project stakeholders, particularly those in reference to various aspects of program management merited inclusion, as they offer further insight on the situation of this project.

### Shincon comment on the DVP portion of this project:

*“Obstacles occurred in DVP section in the first year when the project was carried out as originally planned. The reality of cultural and political system related...Shincon actually made necessary changes of objectives based on the main goal of the project so as to keep the project smoothly going on towards the main goal.”*

### On Staff Changes within WF and Shincon:

*“Comment: During period of ZTCBP, the local staff of DVP in WF and communities was not changed. Chairwoman of ZTMWF was changed once. The leaders of departments in ZTMWF in charge of CAR and CDT were shift from each other at end of 2012.*

*The project manager of ZTCBP from Shincon had been changed three times. The previous project manager was replaced by another employee in Shincon in 2012. The new project manager resigned from Shincon in November 2013 when the managing director of Shincon took over the work. A young lady in Shincon as a project assistant was absent for maternity leave in September 2013.”*

Question from back-donor/NLM:

*“It is written that “lack of project management experience prevents WF from carrying out the project with management logic and methods, reducing this project to a passive completion of tasks from superior administration”. What can be done to prevent this...Should there be greater focus on capacity building of WF?”*

Shincon’s feed back to the donor:

*“About prevention of weak project management of local partners....Here are some comments about this situation in ZTWF from Jean Qin, the previous project manager.”*

*“The project consists of three parts, somehow, it can be regarded as three different projects, as the objectives and target groups were so different. This required the local partner can run the project in a very efficient way that all the three sections of ZTWF should be able to run the project smoothly in a sort of independent way, at the same time, the holistic administrative management of the project was required. It was the first time for the local partner to take such big task, as it was the first time for them do the Oversea supported project. Most of the methods and strategy of project management were totally new for them. In the other hand, we see their strong willingness and potential abilities of learning new things, and their passion of improving women and children’s living conditions in Zhaotong. That’s the one of the main reason we chose to have them as main partner.*

*The resulted based approach is always the theme of the project. But we belief that the sustainability and ownership of the project are the foundation for the good results, even though the results might not be seen at the end of five year project. Some changes and results will be appeared afterward. Shincon learned about this from many development projects previously. Based on this standpoint, the capacity building for the local partner started with some practical and simple tools toward the three sections of ZTWF, which they could reach and learn from their daily work with the target groups. According to the plan, the capacity building for the three sections and the holistic management should go in parallel. But we found that it was difficult. The project was really new and advanced for Zhaotong. There were a lot of the grass-root works to do in the communities, schools and other areas. So the project provided capacity building of the principles of development*

*work to the three sections according to their needs, which made the time and energy consumed. Very little time was used to do the holistic administrative capacity building, excepting for the annual conference and project follow up. By the end of project, the three sections of ZTWF have got many tools and skills of doing participatory approached community development work, by observing and copying what Shincon and external consultants did in the field. That's why the dynamic of the evaluation of the management of ZTWF was in a passive way. But from another angle of view, the achievements of the three parts of project proved the effective management of the three sections of ZTWF."*

**NDC's comment on "Should there be greater focus on capacity building of WF?"**

*"Yes, we believe that despite the achievements that had been demonstrated, further capacity building efforts could indeed increase the overall abilities of this organization. "*

## Annex 1: The Itinerary of Final Evaluation

Time		Location	Attendees	Content
Oct. 27, 2014	9:00 - 12:00	Zhaotong City (Hotel conference room)	Representatives of project executives: project team of Norwegian Shincon, Head of ZTM-WF, project staff of ZTM- WF, project directors of the sub-project of ZTCBP - total of 25 people.  (Additionally: ZTM-WF project people, 2 project people from WF in county and community levels, 2 people responsible for DVP from each community, and 2-3 people responsible for CAR from each school, 1-2 people responsible for infrastructure from Ludian.	1) Project executive parties reported on the project's implementation  2) Evaluation team introduced the purposes, significance and itinerary of evaluation.
	14:00 - 16:00	Zhuquan Community	Anti-Domestic Violence Key People and volunteers under the Women's Federation	1) Answered the questions provided by evaluation team  2) Reported on the project implementation  3) Introduced changes brought by the project  4) Project sustainability
	16:00 - 17:00	Zhuquan Community	Project Staff from ZTM-WF	(as above)
Oct. 28, 2014	8:00 - 12:30	Bishan Community, Daguan County, ZTM-WF	Anti-Domestic Violence Key People and Volunteers under the Women's Federation	1) Answered questions provided by evaluation team  2) Reported on the project's implementation  3) Introduced changes brought by the project  4) Project sustainability
	14:00 - 17:00	The Primary School in Qinggangling Township	Head of school and teachers (4 people),  4 Student representatives 4 Parent representatives	1) Answered questions provided by evaluation team  2) Reported on the project's implementation  3) Introduced changes brought by the project  4) Project sustainability

Oct. 29, 2014	8:00 - 12:00	Zhuanshanbao Infrastructure ZTM	3-4 sub-project directors  1 biogas management technician	1) Answered questions provided by evaluation team  2) Reported on the project's implementation  3) Introduced changes brought by the project  4) Visited biogas and water-pipe system project  5) Interviewed technicians of biogas management  6) Project sustainability
	13:30 - 16:30	Baojian Community, Town of Ludian.	Anti-Domestic Violence Key People and volunteers under the Women's Federation	1) Answered questions provided by evaluation team  2) Reported on the project's implementation  3) Introduced changes brought by the project  4) Project sustainability
Oct. 30, 2014	8:00 - 12:00	Goujiao Infrastructure Community Training	3-4 project staff under direction of WF  4-5 Key People involved in Goujiao Community Training (including village doctors and primary teachers)	1) Answered questions provided by evaluation team  2) Reported on the project's implementation  3) Introduced changes brought by the project  4) Visited water tank / pipe system  5) Interviewed key people involved in Goujiao Village community training  6) Project Sustainability
	14:00 - 17:00	The Ciyuan Primary School	The school leader, 4 teacher representatives 4 student representatives 4 students' parents (who participated in the training)	1) Answered questions provided by evaluation team  2) Reported on the project's implementation  3) Introduced changes brought by the project  4) Project sustainability

## Annex 2: Final Evaluation Index System

First Class Index	Category Index	Objects for Evaluation	Evaluation Methods
Project Organization and Management	Overview of Project Management Structure & Division of Responsibility of all Levels	Shincon, Women's Federation, Project Executives	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction
	Project Services Policy and Scheme	Shincon, Women's Federation, Project Executives	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction
	Project Execution Situation	Shincon, Women's Federation, Project Executives	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction
	Project Supervision System	Shincon, Women's Federation, Project Executives	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction
	Project Archival Records	Women's Federation, Project Executives	Literature review, Interviews
Project Index Situation	<b>Project input:</b> <b>People</b> (Project team, Partners, Service Objects etc.) <b>Money</b> (Fund of investors, Network and resources of partners, time of service objects etc.), <b>Work</b> (activities, coordination etc.)	Women's Federation, Project Executives	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction
	<b>Project output:</b> Target and compliance, level of involvement of project objectives, compliance of project content and plan, whether reached project output target.	Project Executives, Service Objects	Literature review, Interviews, Observation
	<b>Training Activities:</b> Compliance and targets of training content, whether carried out needs survey, whether referenced to project targets, follow-up, satisfaction of training (training plan, record and situation).	Project Executives, Service Objects	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction
Project Effect Situation	<b>Achievement of project objectives:</b> achievement of the goal of project preliminary plan, the extra project objectives achieved.	Project Executives, Service Objects	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction
	<b>Target Understanding:</b> Understanding of project goal of executives, differences with local objectives, how to filter objectives, why change the objectives	Shincon, Women's Federation, Project Executives	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction
	<b>Sustainability of Project Influence:</b> how to guarantee sustainability, to evaluate project sustainability in the aspects of funding, technique and management, to improve the project.	Women's Federation, Project Executives	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction
	<b>Evaluation and Suggestion on Project Sustainability:</b> Experience of project operation and management, lessons of project execution, project needs and compliance between project needs and activities.	Women's Federation, Project Executives	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction
Problems Solving after Mid-term Evaluation	Project objectives not detailed / project activities scattered.	Women's Federation, Project Executives	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction
	If the training referenced the project goal and needs of beneficiaries, improvement in methods of training.	Women's Federation, Project Executives	Literature review, Interviews, Introduction

