

EXTERNAL EVALUATION
PROJECT

Shifting the Paradigm: an effective and innovative alliance with the
indigenous peoples towards the Amazon's conservation and sustainable
development
2008 – 2012

World Wildlife Fund (WWF) – Norway
World Wildlife Fund (WWF) – Peru

Coordinator for Indigenous Organisations of the Amazon Basin - COICA

FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

ALEJANDRA MARIA LAINA AGUDELO
January 27th, 2013

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	3
2. Objective and Methodology	5
3. Regional Context	6
4. Project Evaluation	10
a. Pertinence of design and conceptualization	10
b. Efficiency in the use of management tools and Budget	11
c. Effectiveness regarding results obtained according to planning	13
Table 1: Specific Objectives and Products	14
d. Project Impacts	17
Table 2: Main Project Impacts	18
e. Sustainability, replication and scaling-up	20
Lessons Learned	22
Success Stories	24
Annexes	26
Annex 1	
Annex 2	
Annex 3	

1. Introduction

The Amazon Basin contains the largest continuous rainforest on Earth with a diversity of habitats, species and indigenous peoples. The protection of the Amazon rainforest is critical for the maintenance and regulation of the regional and global climate. Around 25% of the total terrestrial area of the Amazon (approximately 170 million hectares) is comprised of lands, reserves and communal indigenous territories, along with protected areas.

Regarding serious problems of deforestation and forest degradation in a large part of the Amazonian ecosystem, conservation groups and indigenous peoples have acknowledged that working together is essential to approach the threats in the region. In the framework of the Living Amazon Initiative (LAI), WWF has been developing large-scale strategic initiatives in the Amazon, where working with the Coordinator for Indigenous Organisations of the Amazon Basin (COICA) is one of the most important. Jointly, both institutions have identified the necessary strategies to increase the technical, political and organizational capacities of COICA to overcome the threats and pressure on the Amazon Basin and, in this manner, protect indigenous territories and the biological and cultural of the region.

The present evaluation document for the project “Shifting the Paradigm: an effective and innovative alliance with the indigenous peoples towards the Amazon’s conservation and sustainable development”, developed jointly between WWF and COICA, has the purpose of getting to know, analyse and thoroughly evaluate the achievements, main impacts and lessons learned, so that they are taken into consideration for future projects that could be developed by WWF in partnership with indigenous organisations and groups.

The document is comprised of sections which approach the object, methodology, context analysis, pertinence of design, conceptualization and evaluate achievements and weaknesses based on variables, such as efficiency, efficacy, impacts, sustainability, replication, scaling-up, lessons learned, success stories, and structured interviews with stakeholders and technical team.

The evaluation takes into account that the formulation, management, design, planning and execution of the project is a mid to long-term process, and, in this case, it is an exercise from the start, continuous and joint between WWF and COICA, where the conservation groups and indigenous peoples recognize that working together is essential to approach the threats in the territory in face of the large problems of deforestation,

forest degradation of a large part of the Amazonian ecosystem, maintenance and regulation of the regional and global climate, without pretending to approach all the context topics but focusing on the priorities, where the building of trust, definition of priorities, identification of vulnerabilities and opportunities facilitates action in the defence of territories, culture, ecosystems and their relation of indigenous communities in the Amazon basin.

2. *Objective and Methodology*

Objective: To evaluate, objectively and systematically, the design, implementation and results of the project “Shifting the Paradigm: an effective and innovative alliance with the indigenous peoples towards the Amazon’s conservation and sustainable development” with the purpose of determining pertinence, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability in implementation.

Based on documents provided by WWF, the analysis was performed through evidence (reports, annexes), and semi-structured interviews with strategic partners (COICA), executors (WWF network) and other COICA partners, who have been involved in the project in different ways (DAR, BIC, CARE, EDF, IUCN, IPAM).

The criteria considered during the evaluation were centred in answering questions related to the following variables:

- A. Pertinence: emphasizing the project’s flexibility to adapt to changes in the environment where it is developing, and to what point have the proposed objectives and strategies been adjusted.
- B. Efficiency: taking into consideration if the use of resources has been adequate to achieve impact and to develop the expected activities during the execution of the project.
- C. Effectiveness: evaluating the scope of the project results
- D. Impact: evaluation the effects of the project and how this have positively or negatively influence the work of indigenous organisations and their partners
- E. Sustainability: taking into account the impacts, the evaluation considered if it was possible to maintain the effects of the project in time, and how the main partners view this sustainability within their organizations
- F. Lessons learned: From the point of view of the partners, related to impacts and project context

3. Regional Context

The Amazon Basin contains the largest continuous rainforest on Earth, with an unparalleled diversity of habitats, species and peoples. The protection of the Amazon rainforest is fundamental to the maintenance and regulation of the regional and global climate, and the mitigation of climate change. The Amazon is home to more than approximately 349 ethnic groups who speak over 300 languages and dialects, including groups that remain in voluntary isolation. Indigenous peoples inhabit large areas of the Amazon basin as their traditional territories. Almost one fourth of the total surface of the Amazon, over 170 million hectares in total, is contained within titled lands of indigenous communities, reserves and territories, the second largest surface of intact natural forest along with protected areas. Traditional indigenous practices and systems have allowed an effective management of their territories and natural resources. Along with protected areas, indigenous territories constitute natural reserves and corridors for the protection of biodiversity and the maintenance of ecological goods and services; indigenous peoples and population depend on them for their subsistence and well-being.

Currently, national and regional development policies are being promoted, with an emphasis on migration in the Amazon and large-scale (mega) investments in infrastructure projects of roads and dams, as well as mining, oil and gas and forest concessions. These policies, along with a scarce presence and capacity from the national and local governments, and the growing corruption enable the appropriation of lands from large-scale ranchers and agricultural farmers and poor migrants who establish small appropriations. All this leads to larger deforestation and environmental degradation of the Amazonian ecosystem, as well as the usurpation of indigenous territories as a result of political and social unrest.

In this context, it is now acknowledged by conservationists, governments and the organized civil society that alliances and associations with indigenous peoples and their organisations is of critical importance for the conservation of the Amazonian tropical rainforest. Even though it is highly discussed, and, apparently desired, these alliances and associations are just beginning to be established. In part, this is due to a historical lack of trust between governments, the civil society and indigenous peoples and organisations. For years, indigenous peoples, in their search for territoriality to protect their cultures, traditions and ways of life, and the civil society and governments saw each other as competitors for lands. Now, there is recognition that strategic alliances will not only bring mutual benefits, but are essential in order to face

the threats of the current national and regional development policies, as well as globalization as a whole.

During the last decades, the indigenous peoples have been able to become effectively organized in communities, federations and organisations in a representative manner, with the specific objective of ensuring territoriality. In all the Amazonian countries, the indigenous peoples have established local federations represented by national federations (CIDOP in Bolivia, COIAB in Brazil, OPIAC in Colombia, in Ecuador CONFENIAE, APA in Guyana, FOAG in French Guiana, AIDSESEP in Peru, OIS in Surinam and ORPIA in Venezuela). These national federations, in turn, have united under COICA, the Coordinator for Indigenous Organisations of the Amazon Basin.

COICA

The Coordinator for Indigenous Organisations of the Amazon Basin (COICA), founded on March 14th, 1984, expresses the articulation of 390 peoples with 2,779,478 inhabitants in the 10,268,471km² of the Amazon basin, through nine national indigenous organisations of Amazonian countries: Inter-ethnic Association for the Development of the Peruvian Rainforest (AIDSESEP); the Association of Amerindian Peoples of Guyana (APA); Confederation of Indigenous Peoples of Bolivia (CIDOB); Coordinator of Indigenous Organisations of the Brazilian Amazon (COIAB); Confederation of the Ecuadorian Amazonian Nationalities (CONFENIAE); Federation of Autochthonous Organisations of French Guiana (FOAG); Regional Organisation of Indigenous Peoples of the Venezuelan Amazon (ORPIA); Indigenous Organisation of Surinam (OIS); and the Organisations of Indigenous Peoples of the Colombian Amazon (OPIAC).

In a context such as the Amazonian, it is vital for conservationist organisations, such as WWF, to develop a strategic association with COICA and its national bases for the development of a common framework which enables them to face threats, negotiate with governments and other key stakeholders and promotes the development of a new paradigm for the Amazon, centred in the respect of human rights, cultural diversity and values that ensures the protection of biodiversity and the conservation of ecological goods and services.

WWF's Declaration of Principles on Indigenous Peoples and Conservation is committed to respecting, protecting and complying with the basic and customary rights of indigenous peoples (according to national and international legislation) in its conservation initiatives. This implies an institutional recognition of the need to work

with indigenous peoples as partners, where conservation and indigenous problems overlap.

All WWF offices and its associates (Fundacion Natura in Ecuador and FUNDEMA in Venezuela) have centred their programmatic efforts in working with indigenous peoples as partners. However, there is disparity of strategies between WWF offices and associates regarding the best way to work with indigenous peoples and their organisations. Some are centred only with working with local indigenous peoples at a community level, while other offices, especially in Colombia, Ecuador and Peru, have adopted a more structures approach in the formation of effective partnerships and associations with indigenous federation at local and/or national levels.

WWF Peru has been actively participating in Peru for over 30 years and has been a Programme Office established officially in 1998, with a main approach of work in the Amazon, specifically in the promotion of biodiversity, protection, establishment and management of protected areas, certification, sustainable forest management and fair and responsible wood trade, protection and management of freshwater resources, payment for environmental services (hydrological and forest carbon), impact mitigation from large-scale development initiatives (hydrocarbons and road infrastructure) and territorial planning in land use. WWF Peru has formed a far-reaching alliance with public, private and civil stakeholders for the successful application of its efforts, and, in particular, has a strong association with AIDSESP.

The project is implemented jointly between COICA and WWF Peru and WWF Amazonian Initiative, with the collaboration and effective participation of WWF Colombia and Fundacion Natura in Ecuador; there is also participation from WWF Bolivia, WWF Brazil and the Regional Programme Office of Guyana. At the same time, national organizations to COICA have been involved, AIDSESP, CORPI in Peru, OPIAC in Colombia, CIDOB in Bolivia, COIAB in Brazil and APA, FOAG and OIS in the three Guianas.

WWF has supported COICA in two different areas, the internal organization through administrative support and the preparation of planning documents, the delivery of technical assistance in different topics, such as climate change, territorial planning and the impacts of mega-projects, the development of the Indigenous REDD+ concept. Based in the Amazon Initiative (WWF LAI), WWF Peru has led the collaboration with COICA in close coordination with WWF Colombia and Fundacion Natura (Ecuador).

For the past four years (2009-2012), COICA has become a leading voice in the promotion of initiatives concerning indigenous territories and climate change. This has strengthened the technical capacity of COICA, has helped them develop their organizational positions and strategies in key areas, and has provided a long-term vision for the conservation and protection of indigenous territories. For example in the UNFCCC in Cancun (COP 16), COICA has played an important role influencing States to establish minimum quotas of indigenous participation in each event. Furthermore, along with other indigenous organizations, COICA has ensured that the indigenous proposals and their recommendations be included in the event's conclusions.

Subsequently, in the Durban summit (COP UNFCCC 17), COICA presented its own REDD+ vision, which garnered the attention of the international community. Moreover, COICA has strengthened its position among other national and sub-national organisations, especially in Peru and Colombia. As a result of the collaboration with smaller indigenous organisations from the bi-national area between Peru and Ecuador, a strategy was agreed for the protection of the common territory, the ecosystems and biological corridors between the Shuar/ Wampis/ Awajun indigenous peoples of Peru and Ecuador. This will become an activity sphere for COICA to apply its proposal for territorial planning in a pilot project which links regional activities and field activities.

4. Project Evaluation

a. Pertinence of design and conceptualization

The project has facilitated the approach to complex subjects such as indigenous territorial management, incentives for conservation and the political relations and positions in international negotiation arenas; thus making visible problems of regional reach which affect the continued existence of indigenous peoples and the challenges that indigenous organisations face with threats at social and territorial levels, especially those that have to do with national and regional development policies, as well as globalization as a whole. The complexity of COICA as an organisation has required the project to adapt when the generated concepts reach the national bases, to facilitate their presentation and subsequent internal discussions; moreover, the project has generated internal discussions within WWF regarding the pertinence of the work with indigenous organisations and the need for internal coordination and planning to approach problems in a concrete manner and approach possible solutions in a joint manner.

Main aspects:

- The trust bestowed by WWF Peru upon COICA and the facilitation of arenas for discussion were one of the aspects that influenced the generation of trust with other cooperating partners; furthermore, WWF Colombia recognizes the articulated work of the WWF Network that has allowed the strengthening of COICA, which enables the with the base organisation in Colombia (OPIAC) and its participation in discussion arenas with the Ministry of the Environment and Sustainable Development of Colombia (MADS) regarding Indigenous REDD+.
- The conceptualization and formulation of development alternatives by indigenous organisations to avoid impacts of megaprojects is a good alternative (for example, “a new development model in favour of the conservation of indigenous territories of the Amazonian basin based on the Yasuni-ITT Initiative”); however, larger analysis and technical support is needed to direct COICA to define positions regarding this type of initiatives and, at the same time, promote discussions with national bases.
- Indigenous peoples perceive the concept of REDD+ with suspicion and mistrust and link it to the sale of territories and natural services; however, the facilitation of discussion spaces with experts in the subject, other partners from COICA and the WWF Network enabled COICA to understand the development of the COICA at a general level, and adjust their expectations and recognize their fears so as to transform them into a concrete proposal for technical and political support for Indigenous REDD+, which in turn, could be used by their national bases for

negotiations in their countries (e.g., OPIAC in Colombia) and also to be presented in arenas for international discussion and negotiation by COICA (e.g., COP).

- Taking into consideration the complexity of COICA as an organisation, the responsibility they have to generate, propose and position conservation strategies of the Amazonian territories and indigenous peoples, the project has been adjusting to the needs of the organisation and the opportunities of the context. This has enabled progress in topics that have attention at an international level (REDD+ and the development of the concept of Indigenous REDD+, impact of megaprojects, alternative development models), which can facilitate the inclusion of new partners and the structure of new proposals for joint cooperation. Moreover, the permanent adjustment has allowed the project to identify gaps in planning to improve the approach to each one of the challenges.

Pertinence regarding the priorities of WWF as a network and as a region

The articulated work with COICA as a strategic partnership of WWF Peru, brought into the regional scale through collaboration with WWF Network has allowed each one of the members of the WWF Network to better understand the indigenous context in its national, regional and global scales as seen through the experience of COICA and each one of the national processes carried out by country offices (e.g. Peru and Colombia). Through this knowledge, discussions have begun to allow for an adjustment in WWF's conservation agenda and its relation with organisations and indigenous peoples.

In addition, the project allowed WWF the conciliation of agendas and work priorities (e.g. main impacts of mega-projects, impacts of hydrocarbon exploitation, conceptualization and adaptation strategies for climate change, REDD+, indigenous territorial management), with partner indigenous organisations (COICA and its national bases OPIAC, CORPI), facilitating discussion and negotiation at national and international levels.

The development of concepts for Indigenous REDD+ and indigenous territorial management evidenced the technical and political capacity of the WWF Network (countries, initiatives, technical units) to offer support to indigenous organisations and groups in their different levels, in a coordinated and integrated manner, thus facilitating discussions and participation in international and national events for discussion and negotiation, leaving a seed in some national bases (OPIAC, CORPI), to progress in negotiation processes at regional and national scales.

b. Efficiency in the use of management tools and budget

The process for strengthening and development of capacities to improve technical, political, financial and administrative capacities has taken place; thanks to the joint effort with the WWF Network and the capacity to adjust the necessary components in each one of the phases and activities. The direct implementation from COICA, supported by qualified technical personnel hired by the project and personnel from the WWF Network has been fundamental to comply with agreements and propose innovative technical concepts (e.g. development of the Indigenous REDD+ concept, analysis documents regarding the impacts of mega-projects, alternative development models) and administrative procedures (e.g. COICA's administrative and accounting manual, OPIAC's accounting standards).

The facilitation of qualified technical personnel focused on prioritized agendas has enabled the clarification of concepts and has promoted discussion and linkage spaces, bringing forward discussions to different negotiation and discussion forums in national and international arenas, facilitating other cooperation bodies and partners from the WWF Network and COICA to recognized COICA's progress regarding conceptualization and development of proposals.

Alliances/synergies

The articulated work between WWF Peru, with other COICA partners (e.g. IPAM, IUCN, CARE, EDF, DAR) has allowed these partners to recognized and value COICA's progress regarding the improvements in its propositional and conceptual capacity, in topics that were difficult to approach at an internal level, more so, that were not present in international discussions (e.g. Indigenous REDD+, alternative development models).

In addition, other organisations (DAR, CI, CARE, EDF, IPAM) recognize the WWF Network as a catalyst of processes, able to strengthen COICA technically and administratively and to project this strengthening in an increase in capacity to participate, propose and initiate negotiation processes in international spaces.

The WWF Network has progressed in the articulation (e.g. Regional initiatives with country programmes), has identified and adjusted the needs for internal planning to allow capacity strengthening of indigenous organisations and peoples for the protection and conservation of their territories (e.g. LAI and the inclusion of articulated work with indigenous organisations of peoples in their planning FY13- FY16).

c. Effectiveness of results obtained regarding results planned

At an environmental, social and political level, the project in general has strengthened COICA's capacities to generate, propose and discuss alternatives regarding topics of national and global interest, and which affect indigenous territories and the continued survival of their peoples. The proposal for development alternatives (e.g. "A new development model in favour of the conservation of indigenous territories in the Amazonian basins, based on the Yasuní-ITT Initiative"), shows COICA's interest to strengthen its participation in different decision-making spaces and to avoid the impacts of mega-projects which affect indigenous territories; furthermore, the development of concepts (e.g. Indigenous REDD+, climate change manuals, IUCN proposal for indigenous territorial management), promote alternatives which include indigenous traditional knowledge in the approach towards environmental, social, economic and political problems at a global scope.

COICA's participation in international and national spaces for dialogue and negotiation enables the recognition of other partners at national and international levels of an increase in its propositional capacity of alternatives for indigenous territorial management; which could open the doors for new resources to finance the implementation of these proposals.

Table 1: Specific Objectives and Products

Phase	Specific Objectives and Expected Results	Products/Outputs
Phase I	<p>Objective: To conserve the natural resources and biological diversity in an area of 1,700,000 km² belonging to communal territories and indigenous lands in the framework of promotion of indigenous rights in the Amazon basin.</p> <p>Specific: Promote a dialogue process and strengthen capacities at a national and basin levels for the establishment of an effective alliance with indigenous peoples in order to promote the application of conservation policies in the Amazon basin.</p> <p>Specific Objective: Strengthen COICA's capacities to increase organizational development and</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experience exchange, workshops between COICA and WWF to develop a common vision and effective and mutually beneficial partnerships to develop strategies for conservation and political management of indigenous lands (Reports, 2008) • Consensual agenda between COICA and WWF • Agreement document between COICA and WWF signed with the following objectives: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> I. Join forces to face and mitigate threats in the Amazon, its people, and its biodiversity through the guarantee of the environmental goods and services offered by the region II. Promote, with the indigenous people, alternatives for its sustainable development and biological and cultural diversity <p>To reach these objectives, COICA and WWF have identified the following important subjects:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> I. Indigenous territories and natural resources II. Defence of collective rights of indigenous peoples III. Economy and development of indigenous peoples IV. Environmental, social and cultural impacts V. Indigenous peoples and organizational strengthening and development of capacities VI. Climate Change <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Definition of priority actions for the implementation and development of strategies for conservation and promotion of the rights of indigenous peoples: AIDSESEP-Peru Action Plan (Reports, 2008) • Presentation of the WWF Network to COICA and the scope and objectives of the LAI regional initiative and its objectives and articulation ways; LAI's scope before COICA (Reports, 2008). <p>Peru (AIDSESEP, CORPI):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participation of AIDSESEP in Work Group 4¹ for the construction of a National Proposal for Amazonian Development • Strengthening of CORPI which includes: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> I. Design of a model for territorial planning and

¹ As part of the National Coordination Group for the Development of the Amazonian Peoples (created by Supreme Decree N° 117-2009-PCM, modified by Supreme Decree N° 211-2009-PCM) to prepare the National Proposal for Amazonian Development, July-December, 2009

	<p>structure and improve its technical and political role to defend indigenous territories, natural resources and indigenous rights.</p> <p>1. COICA is considered key actors at national and regional levels and at national, regional and international forums.</p>	<p>local governance of natural resources in the macro-region of Marañon, Peru.</p> <p>Colombia (OPIAC):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contribution for a collective construction of CO's RPP. • Creation of an Amazonian Indigenous Roundtable for Environment and Climate Change • Process of previous informed consult in all the indigenous communities involved in the creation of the RAMSAR site "Estrella Inirida". • Preparation of accounting manuals • Design and implementation of OPIAC's webpage (www.opiac.org.co) • Technical proposal for Public Policies for Indigenous Peoples in the Colombian Amazon (OPIAC)
Phase 2	<p>1. COICA's organizational structure is strengthened, which enables its empowerments and internal and external governance.</p> <p>2. A strategy for conservation and sustainable development of the Amazon is developed between COICA and WWF.</p> <p>Technical criteria have been developed to offer a specific guide for planning and development programmes in the Amazon in at least 2 landscapes.</p>	<p>COICA:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • COICA becomes a member of IUCN and presents a technical proposal to present the contribution of indigenous peoples to conservation. • Analysis of main threats affecting the Amazon, a concrete action plan on impact mitigation and the definition of COICA's role. Publication of the strategy for the defence of the territory. • Building of a position on Climate Change and REDD+ (REDD* and its implications, informative manual on climate change for the Amazonian peoples) • Preparation of a three-year strategic plan for COICA • Administrative manual, and a document regarding accounting rules and regulations • Improved COICA webpage (www.coica.org.ec) • A specific document on topics agreed and disagreed from COICA in protected areas of the Amazon (Reports, FY12)
Phase 3	Specific Objective: Develop and	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Document on Indigenous Territorial Management in Peru developed

	<p>disseminate proposals and tools from COICA.</p> <p>Goal 1: COICA actively participates as a member of the IUCN with proposals for the conservation of indigenous territories.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Proposal for indigenous territorial management 2) Proposal for payment mechanisms for environmental services 3) Indigenous REDD+ Proposal 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Indigenous REDD+ Concept disseminated at the UNFCCC COP 17 and COP18 • Alternative development Proposal “A new development in favour of the conservation of indigenous territories in the Amazonian basin based on the Yasuní-ITT Initiative”, which comprehends three main goals: a) reduction of emissions for the non-extraction of fossil fuels, b) protection of biodiversity, and c) social development (Report FY12). • Indigenous REDD+ Proposal built in a gradual and participative manner • Draft “Recognition of indigenous territories as Conservation spaces” presented at the world nature congress, IUCN. Jeju (Korea) • Formalization and strengthening of relationship between COICA and the WWF Network through concrete technical support in the development of concepts and in the participation in international events for discussion and negotiation (inclusion in LAI planning, 2012 work plan, joint participation in international events, direct counselling to leaders and technical advisors in specific topics).
--	---	---

Main aspects

Taking into consideration that, at a global level, topics related to REDD+ and Climate Change are of priority interest, the opportunity that COICA has to present and discuss the concept of Indigenous REDD+ in arenas as important as the COP meetings, the time and effort it takes to prepare for this type of events, could be one of the reasons to prioritize these activities and advance rapidly; this does not mean that other topics were not important (e.g. alternative development projects, the Yasuní-ITT case), on the contrary, they are important inputs that must continue to be fed in order to reach concrete proposals at national and international levels, and that, in the future, could be the negotiation basis with governments, as part of the national bases.

Some processes require more time that the project considered (e.g. informed previous consent for the case of the RAMSAR site Estrella de Inirida). In spite of complying with the legal requirements established by Colombian law, the dynamics of indigenous communities do not always obey the duration of legal processes, so it is necessary to extend work time with indigenous communities before being able to declare the RAMSAR site.

The work promoted by the project and the presentation of proposals from COICA in international and national spaces, have garnered interest from different partners (e.g. European governments, international NGOs, national governments); however, interests and other support from COICA partners (CI, IPAM, EDF, CARE, BIC, IUCN) are not articulated in only one agenda of cooperation from COICA; this may be due to COICA's needs to cover different action fronts and different topics. The lack of articulation of only one cooperation agenda may also become a factor that decreases COICA's response capacity before the different cooperation institutions. In addition, conversations have taken place between COICA partners but no unified working agenda has been defined; in turn, response has been offered in a coordinated manner, optimizing resources. COICA needs to advance in the unification of its criteria for cooperation, enabling order of support and responding in an ordered manner to the needs of the organisation and partners.

Regarding the perception of achievement

The different partners involved in project execution (WWF Network), COICA and other partners of COICA (CI, IPAM, EDF, CARE, BIC, IUCN), perceive as a main achievement of the project and its actions COICA's capacity to generate, propose and disseminate the concepts generated within the indigenous organisations; each one of these products (e.g. alternative development documents, proposal for environmental territorial planning, proposals for indigenous territorial management, Indigenous REDD+ concept, climate change manuals and administrative manuals) has the indigenous vision that allows the continuous survival of peoples through the conservation of their territories

In addition, COICA identifies, as fundamental for the project, the push given to leaders and technical staff to strengthen them in topics of global interest, which were not approached in a clear and concrete manner in indigenous organisations. The added value is an international image which recognizes the seriousness, importance and rigorousness of work from indigenous organisations and their partners in the strengthening of their internal planning processes to respond to the dynamics of indigenous organisations.

Regarding the approach to challenges and problems

The complexity of COICA as an organisation represents a large challenge; the performance of leaders and technical staff in international scenarios represents great progress in the positions presented by COICA in comparison to positions presented in previous occasions. However, the work scale is different, as COICA presents proposals at an international level that must still be adjusted to each one of the national contexts for its bases, to respond to the dynamics of the indigenous organisations in each country.

The technical boost of the project has enabled COICA to advance in proposals that include ample contexts which will allow the bases to adjust them according to the reality in each territory (e.g. the Indigenous REDD+ Concept has been part of the input used by OPIAC in negotiations with MADS in Colombia to adjust it to the reality of different indigenous organisations in Colombia).

Another difficulty identified is the heavy workload for COICA leaders and technical staff; this hinders coordination, definition of agendas and progress in all topics. The project facilitated the hiring of technical staff for specific topics; however, the challenge is to maintain a base technical team which is sufficiently wide-ranging to respond to all of COICA’s commitments with its partners and national bases.

d. Project Impacts

Through the project, COICA has strengthened both technically and politically, garnering interest from some international cooperation agencies from different countries (UN, NW, DM, FIN) of following the advance of the Indigenous REDD+ concept and its implementation in the field (e.g. NORAD). Moreover, the coherence and technical substance of the proposals (Indigenous REDD+, environmental territorial management) have contributed to the existence of openness by international organisms to participate in spaces for negotiation and discussion (COP, Congresses) to listen the proposals of indigenous organisations; these spaces could become a platform to propose other important topics for indigenous peoples.

The development of concepts that approach topics of global importance with technical sustenance have facilitated understanding from COICA’s national bases and, at the same time, have enabled the use of these concepts in national negotiations (in the case of OPIAC, Colombia).

TABLE 2: MAIN PROJECT IMPACTS

MAIN IMPACTS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Technical and political strengthening of COICA and national bases which have worked the topics of Indigenous REDD+ and indigenous territorial management for dialogue, management and formation of partnerships at national and international levels • Increase in COICA’s capacity to develop technical proposals (from dialogue which combines traditional knowledge and scientific knowledge) in a manner that is both gradual (respecting the times of indigenous peoples) and representative (with participation of representatives chosen by the communities). This enables

legitimacy and ensures the sustainability of proposals. It also facilitates the identification of key points that must be adjusted taking into consideration the context in which they are applied.

- Increase in the discussion and negotiation level with the international community on the technical basis, sustaining political positions correctly.
- Transformation of political discourse in concrete proposals technically supported. The preparation of a technical propositional document legitimates and shows Amazonian indigenous organisations and peoples in spaces for international negotiation and discussion (discussions regarding Indigenous REDD+). At the same time, interlocution and partnerships with other donors have been facilitated and the relationships with existing partners have been strengthened.
- The discourse has been strengthened and unified within COICA regarding the topic of Indigenous REDD+. The proposal has allowed for some bases to better understand COICA's position and to adjust the concept for their countries; however, some of the bases are not in accordance with the topic and are undergoing a process of analysis to make decisions on the subject.
- The facilitation of spaces for discussion has strengthened the relationship between COICA and its national bases, breaching discussions on concepts as important as Indigenous REDD+, facilitating the strengthening of the existing links with its bases through the inclusion of regional discussions and the empowerment of the organisation's basis which have elected their representative at an international level.
- The perspective of indigenous peoples regarding REDD+ (priority of territorial titling, monitoring of carbon pirates, early safeguards, holistic management and vision, joint commitment, demand of reduction of greenhouse gas emissions by emitting countries), adds value to the traditional approach of REDD+, and invites a more comprehensive and strategic vision for territorial planning and, also, includes a cultural dimension of indigenous peoples. This will certainly ensure sustainable results and impacts at environmental, social, cultural and political levels.
- COICA's political strengthening and positioning, which translates into higher respect towards COICA (their opinions, proposals, concepts) thanks to the overcoming of internal difficulties found in 2008 and that are now part of a past full of learning.
- The WWF Network, recognized as an entity that is capable of providing technical support, specialized information and facilitation of spaces, has been recognized by COICA's cooperating partners (CI, IPAM, EDF, CARE, BIC and IUCN) as a catalyst of processes with indigenous organisations at national and international levels (facilitation of spaces for COICA at the COP meetings, international forums and congresses, regional roundtable discussions).
- Larger opportunities for leverage of funds to implement protection and conservation actions for indigenous territories, as well as incidence in discussion and negotiation arenas.

Impact regarding contribution to national and regional conservation

Although project actions have been directed towards the strengthening of COICA in the design, discussion and positioning of processes for indigenous territorial management, climate change, alternative development proposals, and land titling proposals; it is still too early to tell that the impacts have become concrete contribution to the conservation of indigenous territories. Actions have not yet been implemented and some of them are at the moment being negotiated, in some cases discussed at an international level and with national bases.

e. Sustainability, replication and scaling-up

Sustainability

COICA has become strengthened in its capacity for incidence, participation and negotiation in spaces for public political discussion and in spaces for international negotiation; however, the end of the project could decrease the acceptance that leaders and technical staff from COICA now have to participate in these spaces. A challenge for COICA at the end of the project is the continuity that could be provided by the validation and adjustment of concepts proposed at the international level in each one of its bases; although progress has been made in cases such as Indigenous REDD+ (OPIAC, Colombia) it is necessary to advance in other topics and with all the bases to put these proposals in motion.

The time and activities developed in the project are appropriate for the dynamic of international political management considering that in any process, results will be seen in the medium to long term; however, discussions held in international scenarios have yet to be taken to the bases, with a concrete and well established portfolio with information for negotiation, continuity of negotiators in COICA's team and adjustments to the permanent regulations in different countries.

Support from the WWF Network is important in the sense that it knows the region, its stakeholders, contacts and international dynamics in the different discussion spaces. It qualifies COICA in relationships, contributes with transfer of technology and quality technical information for context analysis to sustain proposals with technical data.

The success of institutional strengthening is based on qualification and roles at all levels in the organization, starting with bases that will renew ideas, stakeholders and will not

seesaw between changes in knowledge, expertise and representation. It is necessary to avoid the appropriation of the process in a few people, improving their communication within COICA and delegating functions with responsible staff at each level, establishing roles according to capacities and profiles of negotiators.

So that actions began during the project contribute with long-lasting benefits for COICA and its bases, it is necessary to consider that there must be a permanent political leadership sustained in a technical basis that is capable of unifying its cooperation agenda in favour of an organized internal structure with clear mid to long term goals. In this manner, it will be possible to efficiently coordinate technical cooperation that is interested in continuing to support COICA's processes (IPAM, CI, DAR, and IUCN).

There is already a large benefit in international positioning, however, the lack of political pressure within the countries impedes formalization into agreements, laws, and active participation from indigenous communities that may affect the implementation and development of the strategies proposed during the project.

Political and environmental globalization is a constant risk for the definition of public policies in territories of indigenous communities; it is thus necessary to ensure property, control and follow-up of each territory through laws that will promote the communities who inhabit indigenous territories and will allow them to defend themselves against threats from mega-projects and energetic-mining processes.

Replication and scaling-up

The working strategy with COICA is most adequate for replication; what should be strengthened is the active participation in each organization and their bases to obtain concrete results in the territory or replicable exercises for each country, such as REDD+, Yasuní, and that these be evaluated or adjusted depending on their contexts. It must be understood that the dynamics of each country, specifically regarding normativity, political management and national interests are different, and that strategies must be applied as national bases progress in negotiation and discussion processes looking to obtain medium-term results.

5. *Lessons Learned*

Below are the main lessons learned by members of COICA and the WWF Network.

COICA

- a. Participation from COICA representatives in international events of discussion and negotiation (for example, COP 17 and 18, the IUCN's World Conservation Congress, dialogue roundtables in each country, regional discussion roundtables), consolidates indigenous peoples as leading organisations with negotiation and discussion capacities in order to propose concepts and management systems from their traditional knowledge. The project promoted and consolidated this knowledge at an international level, showing that it is possible to embrace other points of view of the context and propose new management systems.
- b. COICA acknowledges the importance of including technical arguments that support the political and cultural discourse of proposals based on social, scientific and economic factors, and, likewise, respects the indigenous spirituality and worldview. The inclusion of these different elements in discussions and negotiations will deliver implemented actions that are more adequate to local and regional realities.
- c. Projects for capacity building of indigenous organisations must be agreed upon and adjusted in a coordinated manner among the involved partners; in this manner, the project is guaranteed to be assumed in its entirety by each and every one. Precisely this type of projects is strengthened while individuality is respected.
- d. The project has encouraged the knowledge and understanding of global problems and situations (climate change, mega-projects and their impacts on territories) which affect all indigenous and non-indigenous territories; this became an incentive for COICA to become more propositional and overcome hostile attitudes towards global concepts (e.g. REDD+), to design and propose a concept adjusted to the particularities of indigenous peoples.
- e. Although COICA has proposed concepts containing the indigenous worldview based on technical arguments (e.g. Indigenous REDD+, indigenous territorial management, development alternatives regarding impacts from mega-projects), it is necessary to involve national bases in the conceptualization and further discussion until the negotiation level is reached; this will enable the evaluation, from the start, of the implementation possibilities of pilot exercises.

WWF Network

- a. Joint work with COICA enabled international experts and coordinators of regional WWF initiatives to identify weaknesses in coordination and communication

regarding technical support that must be offered to partners of established projects; this has facilitated priorities to include identification and consolidation of concrete support in corresponding topics and scenarios.

- b. Clarity in approaches, agreements and disagreements are essential elements in negotiation processes; transparency in approaches, goals and roles for each one of the partners allows WWF and COICA to define a concrete scope, so that contributions are capitalized in concrete impacts for the strengthening of mutual capacities, as in the processes for conservation and management of indigenous territories.
- c. For the WWF Network, the value and recognition of advantages and lessons learned while coordinating actions with indigenous organisations has allowed its consolidation at a regional level as an organisation which respects, understands and technically and financially supports the joint work in order to find solutions to problems in the territories which can be subsequently be proposed in larger scales.
- d. The technical and political will of WWF Peru and its partners in the WWF Network to adapt and adjust activities taking into consideration the circumstances has been fundamental for the correct development of the project.
- e. Feedback, dissemination and discussion of achievements and difficulties found during the project's execution have allowed the WWF Network to obtain impressions and recommendations from its partners; this enabled adjustments to be made from a technical point of view, with regards to international and regional contexts, without losing sight of local realities.
- f. The consolidation of international processes and the strengthening of capacities for decision-makers in indigenous organisations imply the understanding of the holistic vision of communities; the ancestral concepts and application of conservation processes and, to a certain degree, "ancestral compensation mechanisms". For the WWF Network, understanding these dynamics has become a challenge to improve the planning and management for each one of the WWF Network partners, allowing, in this manner, a better response to each challenge and context in countries where working with indigenous organisations is fundamental.
- g. Coordination processes for the WWF Network's agendas show interest in supporting the consolidation of regional work with indigenous organisations; however, improved coordination within the network is necessary to better support indigenous organisations through improved technical capacities when negotiating in international arenas.

6. *Success Stories*

The Coordinator of Indigenous Organisations of the Amazon Basin (COICA for its name in Spanish) was founded in 1984; its labour is to articulate 390 indigenous peoples through nine national indigenous organisations in the Amazonian countries. In this manner, COICA has the great objective of working in the defence and recognition of indigenous territories, the conservation of forests and the respect and application of the rights of indigenous peoples in the Amazon basin.

To achieve its objective, COICA seeks to propose alternatives for the preservation of life through the design of alternative sustainable development models in the Amazon basin. This approach emphasizes an inclusive development model which has, among its principles, the local development of productive alternatives (food sovereignty, development and production with identity), considering, as a fundamental basis, the rights over indigenous territories as a space where history, culture, production and economic development meet with a holistic vision.

However, to reach this point, COICA has had to overcome internal crisis which include the lack of recognition of its leadership by its national bases. In 2008, COICA overcome its, arguably, most profound crisis; this implied the recovery of trust from its bases and international partners, who in the past views COICA as an indigenous organisation with low representation and leadership, centred in political discussions without technical basis.

Starting a strategic alliance with the WWF Network offered COICA the possibility of qualifying, reorganizing and advancing in the design, discussion and proposal of concepts on climate change, development alternatives, territorial planning. Furthermore, it allowed COICA to recover confidence in itself; becoming once again as a leading indigenous organisation in the Amazon, with support from its national bases and generating discussions brought forth to international scenarios.

Today, COICA is recognized for the progress it has made regarding its capacity to propose political discussions with technical support; moreover, it is strengthened to provide its national bases with quality technical information which will facilitate decision-making among its leaders and will bolster negotiation processes with national governments.

The consistency of the articulated work between the WWF Network and COICA, the facilitation of spaces for discussion and the generation of tools have allowed the clarification of visions, approaches and common goals; these have dissipated doubts

about this type of alliances, as there is the great achievement of the noteworthy increase in COICA's capacities to propose and discuss concepts regarding common interests in favour of the conservation and integrated management of indigenous territories.

Other organisations working with COICA (IPAM, DAR, CI, EDF), recognize its progress in the disposition to propose, discuss and negotiate proposals that are beneficial towards indigenous peoples and in favour of the conservation of territories; they also recognize WWF Network as a strategic partner, a catalyst of processes that has facilitated the fundamental spaces for COICA to resume its role as an indigenous regional leader.

For these reasons, this progress is recognized by COICA, the WWF Network and other partner organisations as a success story that should be expressed.

“We must remain united, the Peoples, to build a healthy future for our generations in Peace and Freedom, so we call unto all engaged actors to join efforts in the defence of the Amazon, indigenous territories and our rights, as a guarantee of a Full Life for Amazonian Indigenous Peoples, and as a contribution for the cooling of the planet to counter climate change”².

² From: <http://www.coica.org.ec/index.php/quienes-somos/presentacion>.

7. Annexes – available upon request

Annex 1: Related information delivered by WWF

Annex 2: Terms of Reference (ToR). Final Evaluation of the Project: Shifting the Paradigm: an effective and innovative alliance with indigenous peoples in favour of conservation and sustainable development

Annex 3: Summary of interviews to partner organisations of COICA, the WWF Network and COICA